

Fwd: RHI

John Robinson <[johnrobinson@dup.org.uk](mailto:johnrobinson@dup.org.uk)>

Mon 04/07/2016 21:18

To: Arlene Foster <[arlene@arlenefoster.org.uk](mailto:arlene@arlenefoster.org.uk)>; Timothy Johnston <[timothyjohnston@dup.org.uk](mailto:timothyjohnston@dup.org.uk)>; Simon Hamilton <[simonhamilton@dup.org.uk](mailto:simonhamilton@dup.org.uk)>; Andy Crawford [Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry]

John Robinson | 02890654479 [Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry]

Begin forwarded message:

From: "McCormick, Andrew (DFE)" <[Andrew.McCormick@economy-ni.gov.uk](mailto:Andrew.McCormick@economy-ni.gov.uk)>  
Date: 4 July 2016 at 21:46:51 BST  
To: Simon Hamilton [Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry]  
Cc: John Robinson <[johnrobinson@dup.org.uk](mailto:johnrobinson@dup.org.uk)>  
Subject: Fw: RHI

As discussed I can confirm that, in the period before the RHI problem emerged in June 2015, officials did not warn the DETI Minister about any of the issues that have come to light as the root causes of the difficulties we now face, or draw them to attention as risks that might need to be managed.

The key examples which most clearly should have been highlighted were:

- the question of whether or not to follow DECC in introducing cost controls;
- the point that cost overruns on the scheme might create a budgetary issue for the Resource DEL.

It is also self-evident that the two other major difficulties were not drawn to the Minister's attention, as officials were not aware of them until it was too late:

- the need to secure fresh DFP approval at 31 March 2015; and
- the fact that the tariff had been set at too generous a level (this only emerged when NIAO shared the draft of their Report on the Accounts in the last few weeks).

I hope this is helpful.

Fwd: Immediate re RHI

John Robinson <johnrobinson@dup.org.uk>

Mon 04/07/2016 21:16

To: Timothy Johnston <timothyjohnston@dup.org.uk>; Arlene Foster <arlene@arlenefoster.org.uk>; Simon Hamilton <simonhamilton@dup.org.uk>; Andy Crawford <[redacted]>  
Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

📎 2 attachments (108 KB)

Annex A - Domestic RHI - Final policy.DOCX; ATT00001.htm;

John Robinson | 02890654479 | [redacted]  
Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

Begin forwarded message:

From: "McCormick, Andrew (DFE)" <Andrew.McCormick@economy-ni.gov.uk>  
Date: 4 July 2016 at 21:34:05 BST  
To: Simon Hamilton <[redacted]>  
Cc: John Robinson <johnrobinson@dup.org.uk>  
Subject: Fw: Immediate re RHI

I checked with the branch about the follow up to the Phase 2 consultation on RHI. As Stuart explains below, there was no comprehensive consultation response, nor is there any advice to the then-Minister on the implications of the responses to consultation on the issue of cost control. It is recognised that this is a very unusual scenario, and the only explanation seems to be that the focus was very heavily on the introduction of the domestic RHI scheme, as that was a clear stated Ministerial priority: the domestic scheme was covered in the Phase 2 consultation, and the action on that was the only follow up to that consultation - the further step promised (in italics in Stuart's email) never happened.

If this was to arise in a media question, the suggested line is:

"Normally there would be a comprehensive response to consultation and analysis and advice to Ministers on the options for the way ahead: it appears that, in the case of the options for cost control set out in the Phase 2 consultation on RHI, no such analysis was provided and it is now clear that that contributed to the difficulties that have arisen. So this is one of the missed opportunities for preventative or corrective action, and it is vital that DfE and others learn this and the other salutary lessons from this saga."

I hope this is helpful  
Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone.

**From:** Wightman, Stuart <[Stuart.Wightman@economy-ni.gov.uk](mailto:Stuart.Wightman@economy-ni.gov.uk)>  
**Sent:** Monday, 4 July 2016 20:59  
**To:** McCormick, Andrew (DFE)  
**Cc:** Clydesdale, Alison; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy  
**Subject:** RE: Immediate re RHI

Andrew

Just to confirm, the Department did not publish any response to the Phase 2 Consultation (which closed in Oct 2013) until June 2014, when the attached Final Policy was published for the domestic RHI scheme. The last sentence in the Background section states that: *'The issues relating to the non-domestic scheme will be dealt with separately and a similar response document will issue in due course.'*

The final policy for the November 2015 tariff changes to the non domestic scheme was published in September 2015. None of the other Phase 2 proposals were ever finalised and published.

Stuart



**Department of Enterprise,  
Trade and Investment**

---

# **The Northern Ireland Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive**

**Response to consultation and final policy**

---