- **"Hassle" costs: I have been asked to clarify whether there is enough evidence to say that if these costs were not compensated, the fossil fuel alternatives would still be more attractive to end users.**

  "Hassle" or "barrier" costs are additional non-financial costs incurred by those installing renewable technologies rather than a conventional fossil fuel system. As they are additional costs they must be factored into calculations for determining the appropriate level of tariff that is required to persuade consumers to switch to renewable heat.

  "Hassle" or "barrier" costs include for example, the time required researching different technologies, the inconvenience experienced during installation, and the ongoing inconvenience of operating the system e.g.biomass fuel deliveries.

  The figures used by DETI in the NI RHI are consistent with those used by DECC within the GB RHI (as detailed in the relevant DECC Impact Assessment[1]) and are based on research carried out by Enviros Consulting (2008) – 'Barriers to Renewable Heat[2]'

- **Tariff levels: It would appear that the table of tariff levels included in the decision on the RHI for mainland UK had slightly different numbers than the one which was compared to the tariff levels in NI. I have been asked to clarify the differences, since based on the data included in the table in the former decision the NI levels are lower only for biogas and ground source 100+.**

  The Northern Ireland tariffs are generally lower that the GB RHI levels, not only for biogas and ground source heat pump 100+. The tariffs proposed by the NI RHI, as detailed in the notification paper, are detailed below.

Technology	Banding under the NI RHI	Proposed tariff under the NI RHI (pence per kwh)	Banding under the GB RHI	Tariff under the GB RHI (pence per kwh)
Biomass	Less than 20kWth	6.2	Less than 200kWth	Tier 1: 7.9 Tier 2: 2.0
	Between 20kWth and 100kWth	5.9		
	Between 100kWth and 1000kWth	1.5	Between 200kWth and 1000kWth	Tier 1: 4.9 Tier 2: 2.0
	Above 1000kWth	No tariff	Above 1000kWth	1.0
Biomethane	Biomethane all scales, biogas combustion less than 200kWth	3.0	Biomethane all scales, biogas combustion less than 200kWth	6.8
Ground source heat pumps	Less than 20kWth	8.4	Less than 100 kWth	4.5
	Between 20kWth and 100kWth	4.3		
	100 kWth and	1.3	100 kWth and	3.2

[1] http://www.decc.gov.uk/assets/decc/11/meeting-energy-demand/renewable-energy/3775-renewable-heat-incentive-impact-assessment-dec-20.pdf

[2] http://www.decc.gov.uk/assets/decc/Consultations/Renewable%20Energy%20Strategy%20Consultation/Related%20documents/1_20090501125221_e_@@_2Part1FinalReportv70.pdf

	above		above	
Solar thermal	Below 200kWth	8.5	Below 200kWth	8.5

The only case where Northern Ireland levels are higher than GB is for GSHPs under 20kWth, this is due to the difference in banding as the first banding in the GB scheme is 4.5p for installations up to 200kWth.

- **I have been asked to confirm that it will not be possible for any new installation to benefit from the RHI and at the same time receive a grant contributing to the direct costs of heat production, and to clarify whether the same issue as the one in the mainland UK scheme could arise on CHP installations being potentially eligible for grants under another scheme.**

  From the launch of the scheme it will not be possible to receive grant funding that contributes to the direct costs of a heat production installation and to receive RHI tariffs as well.

  Installations commissioned during the transitional period (from 1 September 2010 to the date the regulations come into operation) that have received a government grant for the direct costs of heating will have two options. Either the grant is repaid and the full RHI is received or the RHI will be reduced by an amount equivalent to the other grant. This will ensure these sites are neither disadvantaged nor over-incentivised.

  Combined heat and power (CHP) installations that are eligible under the RHI scheme and under the Northern Ireland Renewable Obligation (NIRO) scheme will have to choose one of the support schemes. Plants completed after 1 September 2010, that have been claiming the RO plus the 0.5 ROC CHP are not eligible to apply for the RHI.

  From April 2014, it is proposed that new biomass CHP stations will have a one-off choice to claim the RO + CHPQA uplift, or the RO (minus CHPQA uplift) plus the RHI. The transition period will run from 1 April 2014 to 31 March 2016 and will be available only to new accreditations and new additional capacity added between those dates. This will give developers and investors time to understand the support available under the RHI, and the interaction with the RO, while preventing them from receiving a double subsidy of CHP uplift and RHI. Generating capacity which chooses to receive the CHP uplift will be ineligible for the RHI. This is in line with GB.

  Under the Northern Ireland scheme, Anaerobic Digestion sites that are in receipt of NI Renewable Obligation Certificates for electricity generation will not be able to avail of a RHI tariff.

- **I have been asked to confirm that in case the resulting renewable electricity generation capacity of an installation exceeds the individual notification thresholds set in points 160(b)(iii) and (v) of the Environmental aid guidelines (125 MW or, for cogeneration installations, 200 MW), the aid will be notified individually to the Commission. Are cogeneration installations included in the scheme?**

In the event that an installation exceeds the individual notification thresholds set in points 160(b)(iii) and (v) of the Environmental aid guidelines (125 MW or, for cogeneration installations, 200 MW), the aid will be notified individually to the Commission.

Cogeneration installations are not included in the scheme.

- **I have been asked to clarify if there is any "scientific" evidence to support a distinct rate of return of 6% for solar thermal vs. 12% for other technologies.**

  For all the incentivised technologies, barring solar thermal, a rate of return of 12% is provided in addition to net costs of the renewable heat technology in comparison to the fossil fuel counterfactual, which is an oil boiler. This rate of return has been assessed by independent consultants (as detailed in the reports by Cambridge Economic Policy Associates and AEA Technologies that were previously supplied) and is in-line with the GB RHI scheme.

  In regards to solar thermal, as there is no conventional investment as an alternative, as solar thermal do not usually replace a primary heating system, a separate calculation has to be made. Therefore, the proposed solar thermal tariff compensates the full cost of the solar thermal installation. DETI has taken the same approach as used within the GB RHI and set a tariff that is equivalent to the level allocated to offshore wind, which is the marginal cost-effective technology for reaching the 15% UK renewable target.

- **I have been asked to clarify whether, as in the UK mainland scheme; there will be any two-tier approach to small and medium biomass installations.**

  The GB RHI scheme includes a tiering system within the rates for small and medium biomass installations. The tiered incentive rates were calculated to limit subsidy to any incremental fuel expense should the installation exceed a 15% load factor. In developing tariffs DETI also considered this issue however in all cases, the subsidy rates were found to be lower than the incremental fuel expense. Therefore no tiering is required within the NI RHI.

- **Finally, I would need some more information on the transitional period – why is it needed, and why are transitional period installations included? As for para 62 of the RHI mainland UK decision.**

  The transitional period is defined as the 1 September 2010 up to the date on which the NI RHI is finally launched. This transitional period relates to installations that were installed following an announcement by the DETI Minister relating to the introduction of the RHI however in advance of the actual implementation of the scheme. Eligible applications installed during this time period will be able to avail of the new scheme and will be treated as a new installation from the actual start of the scheme.

  It is DETI's view that installations made between 1 September 2010 and the present day have been made on the assumption that RHI payments would be available and would not have been installed had no such expectation been present. Installations made previous to 1 September 2010 did so without the expectation of RHI payments and therefore are outside of the scheme.

This scenario is similar to GB which deemed installations commissioned since 15 July 2009 as eligible (as per para 62 of the GB RHI decision).

It is necessary to deem installations commissioned since 1 September 2010 as eligible as a guarantee was made by the DETI Minister to this effect to ensure the renewable heat market didn't stall with installers adopting a 'wait-and-see' approach. The adoption of a transitional period to ensure continued interest and to prevent against the market stalling is consistent with the GB approach, as per para 62 of the GB RHI decision.

- **"Hassle" costs: I have been asked to clarify whether there is enough evidence to say that if these costs were not compensated, the fossil fuel alternatives would still be more attractive to end users.**

"Hassle" or "barrier" costs are additional non-~~financial costs~~financial costs incurred by those installing renewable technologies rather than a conventional fossil fuel system. As they are additional costs they must be factored into calculations for determining the appropriate level of tariff that is required to persuade consumers to switch to renewable heat.

"Hassle" or "barrier" costs include for example~~, the~~, the time required researching different technologies~~, the~~, the inconvenience experienced ~~during installation~~during installation, and the ongoing inconvenience of operating the system e.g.biomass fuel deliveries. ~~.~~

The figures used by DETI in the NI RHI are consistent with those used by DECC within the GB RHI (as detailed in the relevant DECC Impact Assessment[1]) and are based on research carried out by Enviros Consulting (2008) – 'Barriers to Renewable Heat[2]'

- **Tariff levels: It would appear that the table of tariff levels included in the decision on the RHI for mainland UK had slightly different numbers than the one which was compared to the tariff levels in NI. I have been asked to clarify the differences, since based on the data included in the table in the former decision the NI levels are lower only for biogas and ground source 100+.**

The Northern Ireland tariffs are generally lower that the GB RHI levels, not only for biogas and ground source heat pump 100+. The tariffs proposed by the NI RHI, as detailed in the notification paper, are detailed below.

Technology	Banding under the NI RHI	Proposed tariff under the NI RHI (pence per kwh)	Banding under the GB RHI	Tariff under the GB RHI (pence per kwh)
Biomass	Less than 20kWth	6.2	Less than 200kWth	Tier 1: 7.9 Tier 2: 2.0
	Between 20kWth and 100kWth	5.9		
	Between 100kWth and 1000kWth	1.5	Between 200kWth and 1000kWth	Tier 1: 4.9 Tier 2: 2.0
	Above 1000kWth	No tariff	Above 1000kWth	1.0
Biomethane	Biomethane all scales, biogas combustion less than 200kWth	3.0	Biomethane all scales, biogas combustion less than 200kWth	6.8
Ground source heat pumps	Less than 20kWth	8.4	Less than 100 kWth	4.5
	Between 20kWth	4.3		

[1] http://www.decc.gov.uk/assets/decc/11/meeting-energy-demand/renewable-energy/3775-renewable-heat-incentive-impact-assessment-dec-20.pdf

[2] http://www.decc.gov.uk/assets/decc/Consultations/Renewable%20Energy%20Strategy%20Consultation/Related%20documents/1_20090501125221_e_@@_2Part1FinalReportv70.pdf

	and 100kWth			
	100 kWth and above	1.3	100 kWth and above	3.2
Solar thermal	Below 200kWth	8.5	Below 200kWth	8.5

The only case where Northern Ireland levels are higher than GB is for GSHPs under 20kWth, this is due to the difference in banding as the first banding in the GB scheme is 4.5p for installations up to 200kWth.

- **I have been asked to confirm that it will not be possible for any new installation to benefit from the RHI and at the same time receive a grant contributing to the direct costs of heat production, and to clarify whether the same issue as the one in the mainland UK scheme could arise on CHP installations being potentially eligible for grants under another scheme.**

  From the launch of the scheme it will not be possible to receive grant funding that contributes to the direct costs of a heat production installation and to receive RHI tariffs as well.

  Installations commissioned during the transitional period (from 1 September 2010 to the date the regulations come into operation) that have received a government grant for the direct costs of heating will have two options. Either the grant is repaid and the full RHI is received or the RHI will be reduced by an amount equivalent to the other grant. This will ensure these sites are neither disadvantaged nor over-incentivised.

  Combined heat and power (CHP) installations that are eligible under the RHI scheme and under the Northern Ireland Renewable Obligation (NIRO) scheme will have to choose one of the support schemes. Plants completed after 1 September 2010, that have been claiming the RO plus the 0.5 ROC CHP are not eligible to apply for the RHI.

  From April 2014, it is proposed that new biomass CHP stations will have a one-off choice to claim the RO + CHPQA uplift, or the RO (minus CHPQA uplift) plus the RHI. The transition period will run from 1 April 2014 to 31 March 2016 and will be available only to new accreditations and new additional capacity added between those dates. This will give developers and investors time to understand the support available under the RHI, and the interaction with the RO, while preventing them from receiving a double subsidy of CHP uplift and RHI. Generating capacity which chooses to receive the CHP uplift will be ineligible for the RHI. This is in line with GB.

  Under the Northern Ireland scheme, Anaerobic Digestion sites that are in receipt of NI Renewable Obligation Certificates for electricity generation will not be able to avail of a RHI tariff.

- **I have been asked to confirm that in case the resulting renewable electricity generation capacity of an installation exceeds the individual notification thresholds set in points 160(b)(iii) and (v) of the Environmental aid guidelines (125 MW or, for cogeneration installations, 200 MW), the aid will be notified individually to the Commission. Are cogeneration installations included in the scheme?**

In the event that an installation exceeds the individual notification thresholds set in points 160(b)(iii) and (v) of the Environmental aid guidelines (125 MW or, for cogeneration installations, 200 MW), the aid will be notified individually to the Commission.

Cogeneration installations are not included in the scheme.

- **I have been asked to clarify if there is any "scientific" evidence to support a distinct rate of return of 6% for solar thermal vs. 12% for other technologies.**

  For all the incentivised technologies, barring solar thermal, a rate of return of 12% is provided in addition to net costs of the renewable heat technology in comparison to the fossil fuel counterfactual, which is an oil boiler. This rate of return has been assessed by independent consultants (as detailed in the reports by Cambridge Economic Policy Associates and AEA Technologies that were previously supplied) and is in-line with the GB RHI scheme.

  In regards to solar thermal, as there is no conventional investment as an alternative, as solar thermal do not usually replace a primary heating system, a separate calculation has to be made. Therefore, the proposed solar thermal tariff compensates the full cost of the solar thermal installation. DETI has taken the same approach as used within the GB RHI and set a tariff that is equivalent to the level allocated to offshore wind, which is the marginal cost-effective technology for reaching the 15% UK renewable target.

- **I have been asked to clarify whether, as in the UK mainland scheme; there will be any two-tier approach to small and medium biomass installations.**

  The GB RHI scheme includes a tiering system within the rates for small and medium biomass installations. The tiered incentive rates were calculated to limit subsidy to any incremental fuel expense should the installation exceed a 15% load factor. In developing tariffs DETI also considered this issue however in all cases, the subsidy rates were found to be lower than the incremental fuel expense. Therefore no tiering is required within the NI RHI.

- **Finally, I would need some more information on the transitional period – why is it needed, and why are transitional period installations included? As for para 62 of the RHI mainland UK decision.**

  The transitional period is defined as the 1 September 2010 up to the date on which the NI RHI is finally launched. This transitional period relates to installations that were installed following an announcement by the DETI Minister relating to the introduction of the RHI however in advance of the actual implementation of the scheme. Eligible applications installed during this time period will be able to avail of the new scheme and will be treated as a new installation from the actual start of the scheme.

  It is DETI's view that installations made between 1 September 2010 and the present day have been made on the assumption that RHI payments would be available and would not have been installed had no such expectation been present. Installations made previous to 1 September 2010 did so without the expectation of RHI payments and therefore are outside of the scheme.

This scenario is similar to GB which deemed installations commissioned since 15 July 2009 as eligible (as per para 62 of the GB RHI decision).

It is necessary to deem installations commissioned since 1 September 2010 as eligible as a guarantee was made by the DETI Minister to this effect to ensure the renewable heat market didn't stall with installers adopting a 'wait-and-see' approach. The adoption of a transitional period to ensure continued interest and to prevent against the market stalling is consistent with the GB approach, as per para 62 of the GB RHI decision.

- **"Hassle" costs: I have been asked to clarify whether there is enough evidence to say that if these costs were not compensated, the fossil fuel alternatives would still be more attractive to end users.**

  "Hassle" or "barrier" costs are additional costs incurred by those installing renewable technologies rather than a conventional fossil fuel system. As they are additional costs they must be factored into calculations for determining the appropriate level of tariff that is required to ensure consumers switch to renewable heat.

  "Hassle" or "barrier" costs include the costs of additional installation work when installing renewable heat (man hours), the inconvenience experienced when installing and time required researching different technologies. All of this issues are additional to installing conventional fossil fuels and therefore must be considered.

  The figures used by DETI in the NI RHI are consistent with those used by DECC within the GB RHI as detailed in the relevant DECC Impact Assessment[1][2].

- **Tariff levels: It would appear that the table of tariff levels included in the decision on the RHI for mainland UK had slightly different numbers than the one which was compared to the tariff levels in NI. I have been asked to clarify the differences, since based on the data included in the table in the former decision the NI levels are lower only for biogas and ground source 100+.**

  The Northern Ireland tariffs are generally lower that the GB RHI levels, not only for biogas and ground source heat pump 100+. The tariffs proposed by the NI RHI, as detailed in the notification paper, are detailed below.

Technology	Banding under the NI RHI	Proposed tariff under the NI RHI (pence per kwh)	Banding under the GB RHI	Tariff under the GB RHI (pence per kwh)
Biomass	Less than 20kWth	6.2	Less than 200kWth	Tier 1: 7.9 Tier 2: 2.0
	Between 20kWth and 100kWth	5.9		
	Between 100kWth and 1000kWth	1.5	Between 200kWth and 1000kWth	Tier 1: 4.9 Tier 2: 2.0
	Above 1000kWth	No tariff	Above 1000kWth	1.0
Biomethane	Biomethane all scales, biogas combustion less than 200kWth	3.0	Biomethane all scales, biogas combustion less than 200kWth	6.8
Ground source heat pumps	Less than 20kWth	8.4	Less than 100 kWth	4.5
	Between 20kWth and 100kWth	4.3		
	100 kWth and	1.3	100 kWth and	3.2

[1] http://www.decc.gov.uk/assets/decc/11/meeting-energy-demand/renewable-energy/3775-renewable-heat-incentive-impact-assessment-dec-20.pdf

[2] http://www.decc.gov.uk/assets/decc/Consultations/Renewable%20Energy%20Strategy%20Consultation/Related%20documents/1_20090501125221_e_@@_2Part1FinalReportv70.pdf

	above		above	
Solar thermal	Below 200kWth	8.5	Below 200kWth	8.5

The only case where Northern Ireland levels are higher than GB is for GSHPs under 20kWth, this is due to the difference in banding as the first banding in the GB scheme is 4.5p for installations up to 200kWth.

- **I have been asked to confirm that it will not be possible for any new installation to benefit from the RHI and at the same time receive a grant contributing to the direct costs of heat production, and to clarify whether the same issue as the one in the mainland UK scheme could arise on CHP installations being potentially eligible for grants under another scheme.**

  From the launch of the scheme it will not be possible to receive grant funding that contributes to the direct costs of a heat production installation and to receive RHI tariffs as well.

  Installations commissioned during the transitional period (from 1 September 2010 to the date the regulations come into operation) that have received a government grant for the direct costs of heating will have two options. Either the grant is repaid and the full RHI (20 years) is received or the number of years they are eligible for RHI will be reduced by a corresponding level to the received grant. This will ensure these sites are neither disadvantaged nor over-incentivised.

  Combined heat and power (CHP) installations that are eligible under the RHI scheme and under the Northern Ireland Renewable Obligation (NIRO) scheme will have to choose one of the support schemes. Plants completed after 1 September 2010, that have been claiming the RO plus the 0.5 ROC CHP are not eligible to apply for the RHI.

  From April 2014, it is proposed that new biomass CHP stations will have a one-off choice to claim the RO + CHPQA uplift, or the RO (minus CHPQA uplift) plus the RHI. The transition period will run from 1 April 2014 to 31 March 2016 and will be available only to new accreditations and new additional capacity added between those dates. This will give developers and investors time to understand the support available under the RHI, and the interaction with the RO, while preventing them from receiving a double subsidy of CHP uplift and RHI. Generating capacity which chooses to receive the CHP uplift will be ineligible for the RHI. This is in line with GB.

  Under the Northern Ireland scheme, Anaerobic Digestion sites that are in receipt of NI Renewable Obligation Certificates for electricity generation will not be able to avail of a RHI tariff.

- **I have been asked to confirm that in case the resulting renewable electricity generation capacity of an installation exceeds the individual notification thresholds set in points 160(b)(iii) and (v) of the Environmental aid guidelines (125 MW or, for cogeneration installations, 200 MW), the aid will be notified individually to the Commission. Are cogeneration installations included in the scheme?**

In the event that an installation exceeds the individual notification thresholds set in points 160(b)(iii) and (v) of the Environmental aid guidelines (125 MW or, for cogeneration installations, 200 MW), the aid will be notified individually to the Commission.

Cogeneration installations are not included in the scheme.

- **I have been asked to clarify if there is any "scientific" evidence to support a distinct rate of return of 6% for solar thermal vs. 12% for other technologies.**

  For all the incentivised technologies, barring solar thermal, a rate of return of 12% is provided in addition to net costs of the renewable heat technology in comparison to the fossil fuel counterfactual, which is an oil boiler. This rate of return has been assessed by independent consultants (as detailed in the reports by Cambridge Economic Policy Associates and AEA Technologies that were previously supplied) and is in-line with the GB RHI scheme.

  In regards to solar thermal, as there is no conventional investment as an alternative, as solar thermal do not usually replace a primary heating system, a separate calculation has to be made. Therefore, the proposed solar thermal tariff compensates the full cost of the solar thermal installation. If a rate of return of 12% rate was applied it was assessed that a disproportionate of the total budget would have been skewed to cover solar thermal costs and this would not support the achievement of the set target. Therefore, DETI has taken the same approach as used within the GB RHI and set a tariff that is equivalent to the level allocated to offshore wind, which is the marginal cost-effective technology for reaching the 15% UK renewable target.

- **I have been asked to clarify whether, as in the UK mainland scheme; there will be any two-tier approach to small and medium biomass installations.**

  The GB RHI scheme includes a tiering system within the rates for small and medium biomass installations. The tiered incentive rates were calculated to limit subsidy to any incremental fuel expense should the installation exceed a 15% load factor. In developing tariffs DETI also considered this issue however in all cases, the subsidy rates were found to be lower than the incremental fuel expense. Therefore no tiering is required within the NI RHI.

- **Finally, I would need some more information on the transitional period – why is it needed, and why are transitional period installations included? As for para 62 of the RHI mainland UK decision.**

  The transitional period is defined as the 1 September 2010 up to the date on which the NI RHI is finally launched. This transitional period relates to installations that were installed following an announcement by the DETI Minister relating to the introduction of the RHI however in advance of the actual implementation of the scheme. Eligible applications installed during this time period will be able to avail of the new scheme and will be treated as a new installation from the actual start of the scheme.

  It is DETI's view that installations made between 1 September 2010 and the present day have been made on the assumption that RHI payments would be available and would not have been installed had no such expectation been present. Installations made

previous to 1 September 2010 did so without the expectation of RHI payments and therefore are outside of the scheme.

This scenario is similar to GB which deemed installations commissioned since 15 July 2009 as eligible (as per para 62 of the GB RHI decision).

It is necessary to deem installations commissioned since 1 September 2010 as eligible as a guarantee was made by the DETI Minister to this effect to ensure the renewable heat market didn't stall with installers adopting a 'wait-and-see' approach. The adoption of a transitional period to ensure continued interest and to prevent against the market stalling is consistent with the GB approach, as per para 62 of the GB RHI decision.

From: Hutchinson, Peter
To: Moore, Stephen; Rebecca.Ireland@fco.gsi.gov.uk
Cc: Carr, Paul; Ryan, Damien; Porter Kate (CCP); Hepper, Fiona; McCutcheon, Joanne
Subject: RE: Case SA.34140 - Renewable Heat Incentive - NI - Some questions
Date: 30 May 2012 16:39:00
Attachments: NI RHI - State Aid queries.DOCX
image001.png

Rebecca,

Please see attached response to the questions asked by the Commission regarding the Northern Ireland RHI.

Grateful if you would consider and respond on our behalf to the Commission.

Thanks in advance.

Peter

Peter Hutchinson
Renewable Heat
Department of Enterprise, Trade & Investment
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP
Tel: 028 9052 9532 (ext: 29532)
Textphone: 028 9052 9304
Web: www.detini.gov.uk

www.ni2012.com

From: Moore, Stephen
Sent: 29 May 2012 11:47
To: Rebecca.Ireland@fco.gsi.gov.uk
Cc: Carr, Paul; Ryan, Damien; Porter Kate (CCP); Hutchinson, Peter; Hepper, Fiona; McCutcheon, Joanne
Subject: FW: Case SA.34140 - Renewable Heat Incentive - NI - Some questions
Importance: High

Rebecca

I've discussed with Peter and this shouldn't be a problem.

Stephen

Stephen Moore
European Support Unit
Department of Enterprise, Trade & Investment
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP
Tel: 028 9052 9415 (ext: 29415)
Textphone: 028 9052 9304
Web: www.detini.gov.uk