

From: [Wightman, Stuart](#)
To: [Dukelow, Victor](#)
Cc: [Murphy, Shane](#); [Stewart, Chris \(DFE\)](#); [Marten, Lucy](#); [McCann, Brendan](#); [Woods, Michael \(DFE\)](#); [Cousins, Heather](#); [McCormick, Andrew \(DFE\)](#); [Smith, Alan](#)
Subject: Engagement with CEPA -
Date: 17 October 2016 12:52:53
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.gif](#)
[Addendum to Economic Appraisal by CEPA Feb 2012 uploaded to SFTP 7 September 2016.tr5](#)
[RHI Business Case - Annex A - CEPA and AEA RHI Report 2011.tr5](#)
[Further correspondence with CEPA re Domestic RHI - Cost Benefit.tr5](#)

Victor

Andrew has asked if ASU would write formally to CEPA to formally seek their opinion as to why they did not recommend a cap at 17% (i.e. after 1,490 hours). It is unlikely that any of the CEPA economists involved in the original work will be available, however it is important that we secure a view/explanation as their work is central to the whole RHI issue.

It is highly likely that the PAC may call CEPA to give evidence at its ongoing Inquiry on the RHI scheme.

I attach TRIM links to the original CEPA appraisal (2011) and the 2012 Addendum (following public consultation). I've managed to find the following CEPA contacts from previous email exchanges.

Paget Fulcher (paget.fulcher@cepa.co.uk)

Stephanie Dickenson

Patrick Taylor

Ian Alexander

I'm happy to meet to discuss if this would be beneficial.

Thanks, Stuart

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency

Department for the Economy

Netherleigh

Massey Avenue

Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



[cid:image002.gif@01D22871.91432D40](#)



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: [McCormick, Andrew \(DFE\)](#)
To: [Wightman, Stuart](#); [Dukelow, Victor](#)
Cc: [Murphy, Shane](#); [Stewart, Chris \(DFE\)](#); [Marten, Lucy](#); [McCann, Brendan](#); [Woods, Michael \(DFE\)](#); [Cousins, Heather](#); [Smith, Alan](#)
Subject: Re: Engagement with CEPA
Date: 17 October 2016 15:00:37
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.gif](#)

Many thanks

Given the critical comments in the NIAO Report about the thoughtless transposition of the CEPA point about tiering, I would be very interested in CEPA's comments on:

- the precise intention behind their initial recommendations that tiering was not needed; and

- their thoughts on the business case - especially the three pages where the tariff and the cost of fuel appear.

They should have a chance to see the NIAO Report and the Business Case before any substantive discussion.

Many thanks.

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone.

From: Wightman, Stuart
Sent: Monday, 17 October 2016 13:47
To: Dukelow, Victor
Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DFE); Cousins, Heather; McCormick, Andrew (DFE); Smith, Alan
Subject: RE: Engagement with CEPA

Victor, further to my earlier email below about engaging with CEPA, our initial contact should be made through the CEO - Mark Cockburn using the contact details below.

Thanks, Stuart

Queens House
55-56 Lincoln's Inn Fields
London WC2A 3LJ
United Kingdom
+44 (0)20 7269 0210

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: Wightman, Stuart

Sent: 17 October 2016 12:53

To: Dukelow, Victor

Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; McCormick, Andrew (DFE); Smith, Alan

Subject: Engagement with CEPA -

Victor

Andrew has asked if ASU would write formally to CEPA to formally seek their opinion as to why they did not recommend a cap at 17% (i.e. after 1,490 hours). It is unlikely that any of the CEPA economists involved in the original work will be available, however it is important that we secure a view/explanation as their work is central to the whole RHI issue.

It is highly likely that the PAC may call CEPA to give evidence at its ongoing Inquiry on the RHI scheme.

I attach TRIM links to the original CEPA appraisal (2011) and the 2012 Addendum (following public consultation). I've managed to find the following CEPA contacts from previous email exchanges.

Paget Fulcher (paget.fulcher@cepa.co.uk)

Stephanie Dickenson

Patrick Taylor

Ian Alexander

I'm happy to meet to discuss if this would be beneficial.

Thanks, Stuart

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency

Department for the Economy

Netherleigh

Massey Avenue

Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



[cid:image002.gif@01D22871.91432D40](#)



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: [Stewart, Chris \(DFE\)](#)
To: [McCormick, Andrew \(DFE\)](#); [Wightman, Stuart](#); [Dukelow, Victor](#)
Cc: [Murphy, Shane](#); [Marten, Lucy](#); [McCann, Brendan](#); [Woods, Michael \(DfE\)](#); [Cousins, Heather](#); [Smith, Alan](#); [McIlwrath, Linda](#)
Subject: RE: Engagement with CEPA
Date: 17 October 2016 15:05:37
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.gif](#)

Colleagues

I suggest that CEPA should also be asked what it considered to be the implications for its (non) tiering recommendation of its subsequent recommendation to increase the tariff.

C

From: McCormick, Andrew (DFE)
Sent: 17 October 2016 15:01
To: Wightman, Stuart; Dukelow, Victor
Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; Smith, Alan
Subject: Re: Engagement with CEPA

Many thanks

Given the critical comments in the NIAO Report about the thoughtless transposition of the CEPA point about tiering, I would be very interested in CEPA's comments on:

- the precise intention behind their initial recommendations that tiering was not needed; and
- their thoughts on the business case - especially the three pages where the tariff and the cost of fuel appear.

They should have a chance to see the NIAO Report and the Business Case before any substantive discussion.

Many thanks.

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone.

From: Wightman, Stuart
Sent: Monday, 17 October 2016 13:47
To: Dukelow, Victor
Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; McCormick, Andrew (DFE); Smith, Alan
Subject: RE: Engagement with CEPA

Victor, further to my earlier email below about engaging with CEPA, our initial contact should be made through the CEO - Mark Cockburn using the contact details below.

Thanks, Stuart

Queens House
55-56 Lincoln's Inn Fields
London WC2A 3LJ
United Kingdom
+44 (0)20 7269 0210

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP
Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)
Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry
TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425
Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: Wightman, Stuart
Sent: 17 October 2016 12:53
To: Dukelow, Victor
Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; McCormick, Andrew (DFE); Smith, Alan
Subject: Engagement with CEPA -

Victor

Andrew has asked if ASU would write formally to CEPA to formally seek their opinion as to why they did not recommend a cap at 17% (i.e. after 1,490 hours). It is unlikely that any of the CEPA economists involved in the original work will be available, however it is important that we secure a view/explanation as their work is central to the whole RHI issue.

It is highly likely that the PAC may call CEPA to give evidence at its ongoing Inquiry on the RHI scheme.

I attach TRIM links to the original CEPA appraisal (2011) and the 2012 Addendum (following public consultation). I've managed to find the following CEPA contacts from previous email exchanges.

Paget Fulcher (paget.fulcher@cepa.co.uk)
Stephanie Dickenson

Patrick Taylor
Ian Alexander

I'm happy to meet to discuss if this would be beneficial.

Thanks, Stuart

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)
Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

Mob:

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



<cid:image002.gif@01D22871.91432D40>



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: [McCormick, Andrew \(DFE\)](#)
To: [Stewart, Chris \(DFE\)](#); [Wightman, Stuart](#); [Dukelow, Victor](#)
Cc: [Murphy, Shane](#); [Marten, Lucy](#); [McCann, Brendan](#); [Woods, Michael \(DfE\)](#); [Cousins, Heather](#); [Smith, Alan](#); [McIlwrath, Linda](#)
Subject: Re: Engagement with CEPA
Date: 17 October 2016 15:14:14
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.gif](#)

Agreed

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone.

From: Stewart, Chris (DFE)
Sent: Monday, 17 October 2016 15:05
To: McCormick, Andrew (DFE); Wightman, Stuart; Dukelow, Victor
Cc: Murphy, Shane; Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; Smith, Alan; McIlwrath, Linda
Subject: RE: Engagement with CEPA

Colleagues

I suggest that CEPA should also be asked what it considered to be the implications for its (non) tiering recommendation of its subsequent recommendation to increase the tariff.

C

From: McCormick, Andrew (DFE)
Sent: 17 October 2016 15:01
To: Wightman, Stuart; Dukelow, Victor
Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; Smith, Alan
Subject: Re: Engagement with CEPA

Many thanks

Given the critical comments in the NIAO Report about the thoughtless transposition of the CEPA point about tiering, I would be very interested in CEPA's comments on:

- the precise intention behind their initial recommendations that tiering was not needed; and

- their thoughts on the business case - especially the three pages where the tariff and the cost of fuel appear.

They should have a chance to see the NIAO Report and the Business Case before any substantive discussion.

Many thanks.

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone.

From: Wightman, Stuart
Sent: Monday, 17 October 2016 13:47
To: Dukelow, Victor

Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; McCormick, Andrew (DFE); Smith, Alan
Subject: RE: Engagement with CEPA

Victor, further to my earlier email below about engaging with CEPA, our initial contact should be made through the CEO - Mark Cockburn using the contact details below.

Thanks, Stuart

Queens House
55-56 Lincoln's Inn Fields
London WC2A 3LJ
United Kingdom
+44 (0)20 7269 0210

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: Wightman, Stuart

Sent: 17 October 2016 12:53

To: Dukelow, Victor

Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; McCormick, Andrew (DFE); Smith, Alan

Subject: Engagement with CEPA -

Victor

Andrew has asked if ASU would write formally to CEPA to formally seek their opinion as to why they did not recommend a cap at 17% (i.e. after 1,490 hours). It is unlikely that any of the CEPA economists involved in the original work will be available, however it is important that we secure a view/explanation as their work is central to the whole RHI issue.

It is highly likely that the PAC may call CEPA to give evidence at its ongoing Inquiry on the RHI scheme.

I attach TRIM links to the original CEPA appraisal (2011) and the 2012 Addendum (following public consultation). I've managed to find the following CEPA contacts from previous email exchanges.

Paget Fulcher (paget.fulcher@cepa.co.uk)
Stephanie Dickenson
Patrick Taylor
Ian Alexander

I'm happy to meet to discuss if this would be beneficial.

Thanks, Stuart

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP
Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)
Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry
TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425
Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



<cid:image002.gif@01D22871.91432D40>



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: [Dukelow, Victor](#)
To: [Wightman, Stuart](#)
Cc: [Smith, Alan](#); [McCann, Brendan](#); [Marten, Lucy](#); [Woods, Michael \(DFE\)](#); [Cousins, Heather](#); [Murphy, Shane](#); [Stewart, Chris \(DFE\)](#); [McCormick, Andrew \(DFE\)](#)
Subject: RE: Engagement with CEPA
Date: 17 October 2016 17:04:07
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.gif](#)

Stuart,

As discussed we will draft a letter raising the issues to which we are keen to receive clarification. In parallel will give consideration to the handling in order to maximise the likelihood of a prompt response.

Thanks,

Victor

Sent from my Android device managed by BlackBerry Enterprise Service

On 17 Oct 2016 1:47 p.m., "Wightman, Stuart" wrote:

Victor, further to my earlier email below about engaging with CEPA, our initial contact should be made through the CEO - Mark Cockburn using the contact details below.

Thanks, Stuart

Queens House

55-56 Lincoln's Inn Fields

London WC2A 3LJ

United Kingdom

+44 (0)20 7269 0210

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency

Department for the Economy

Netherleigh

Massey Avenue

Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: Wightman, Stuart

Sent: 17 October 2016 12:53

To: Dukelow, Victor

Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DFE); Cousins, Heather; McCormick, Andrew (DFE); Smith, Alan

Subject: Engagement with CEPA -

Victor

Andrew has asked if ASU would write formally to CEPA to formally seek their opinion as to why they did not recommend a cap at 17% (i.e. after 1,490 hours). It is unlikely that any of the CEPA economists involved in the original work will be available, however it is important that we secure a view/explanation as their work is central to the whole RHI issue.

It is highly likely that the PAC may call CEPA to give evidence at its ongoing Inquiry on the RHI scheme.

I attach TRIM links to the original CEPA appraisal (2011) and the 2012 Addendum (following public consultation). I've managed to find the following CEPA contacts from previous email exchanges.

Paget Fulcher (paget.fulcher@cepa.co.uk)

Stephanie Dickenson

Patrick Taylor

Ian Alexander

I'm happy to meet to discuss if this would be beneficial.

Thanks, Stuart

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency

Department for the Economy

Netherleigh

Massey Avenue

Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



<cid:image002.gif@01D22871.91432D40>



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: [McCormick, Andrew \(DFE\)](#)
To: [Dukelow, Victor](#)
Cc: [Smith, Alan](#); [McCann, Brendan](#); [Marten, Lucy](#); [Woods, Michael \(DfE\)](#); [Cousins, Heather](#); [Murphy, Shane](#); [Stewart, Chris \(DFE\)](#); [Wightman, Stuart](#)
Subject: RE: Engagement with CEPA
Date: 17 October 2016 17:19:48
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.gif](#)

Many thanks

From: Dukelow, Victor
Sent: 17 October 2016 17:04
To: Wightman, Stuart
Cc: Smith, Alan; McCann, Brendan; Marten, Lucy; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); McCormick, Andrew (DFE)
Subject: RE: Engagement with CEPA

Stuart,

As discussed we will draft a letter raising the issues to which we are keen to receive clarification. In parallel will give consideration to the handling in order to maximise the likelihood of a prompt response.

Thanks,

Victor

Sent from my Android device managed by BlackBerry Enterprise Service

On 17 Oct 2016 1:47 p.m., "Wightman, Stuart" <Stuart.Wightman@economy-ni.gov.uk> wrote:

Victor, further to my earlier email below about engaging with CEPA, our initial contact should be made through the CEO - Mark Cockburn using the contact details below.

Thanks, Stuart

Queens House
55-56 Lincoln's Inn Fields
London WC2A 3LJ
United Kingdom
+44 (0)20 7269 0210

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP
Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)
Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry
TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: Wightman, Stuart

Sent: 17 October 2016 12:53

To: Dukelow, Victor

Cc: Murphy, Shane; Stewart, Chris (DFE); Marten, Lucy; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Cousins, Heather; McCormick, Andrew (DFE); Smith, Alan

Subject: Engagement with CEPA -

Victor

Andrew has asked if ASU would write formally to CEPA to formally seek their opinion as to why they did not recommend a cap at 17% (i.e. after 1,490 hours). It is unlikely that any of the CEPA economists involved in the original work will be available, however it is important that we secure a view/explanation as their work is central to the whole RHI issue.

It is highly likely that the PAC may call CEPA to give evidence at its ongoing Inquiry on the RHI scheme.

I attach TRIM links to the original CEPA appraisal (2011) and the 2012 Addendum (following public consultation). I've managed to find the following CEPA contacts from previous email exchanges.

Paget Fulcher (paget.fulcher@cepa.co.uk)

Stephanie Dickenson

Patrick Taylor

Ian Alexander

I'm happy to meet to discuss if this would be beneficial.

Thanks, Stuart

Stuart Wightman

Energy Efficiency

Department for the Economy

Netherleigh

Massey Avenue

Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9425 (ext: 29425)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



[cid:image002.gif@01D22871.91432D40](#)



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?