

It would be really useful if you were able to look into these points. In other areas we are making good progress on providing information for Friday. However, as regards the basis of the engineering numbers I have not had a response from the company that provided those to us, so I can't be sure that we can shed any more light on these issues.

Thanks again and best regards,

Mark

Mark Cockburn

Director

Cambridge Economic Policy Associates | Queens House, 55-56 Lincoln's Inn Fields, London, WC2A 3LJ |
T: +44 20 7269 0210 | M: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry | mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk | www.cepa.co.uk |
www.linkedin.com/company/cepa-ltd

From: Dukelow, Victor [<mailto:Victor.Dukelow@economy-ni.gov.uk>]

Sent: 01 November 2016 11:12

To: Mark Cockburn <mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>

Cc: Cousins, Heather <Heather.Cousins@economy-ni.gov.uk>; McCann, Brendan <Brendan.McCann@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Woods, Michael (DFE) <Michael.Woods@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Stewart, Chris (DFE) <Chris.Stewart@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Wightman, Stuart <Stuart.Wightman@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Marten, Lucy <Lucy.Marten@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Murphy, Shane <Shane.Murphy@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Smith, Alan <Alan.Smith@economy-ni.gov.uk>; McCormick, Andrew (DFE) <Andrew.McCormick@economy-ni.gov.uk>

Subject: RE: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

Mark,

Further your e-mail below which sought additional details on the Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive Scheme, please find attached an Excel spreadsheet which sets out payments made by technology, by year and by estimated heat output. A further table presents the number of boilers operating within the scheme and their capacity by SIC code and by year. You will note that data in a number of the cells have been suppressed and technologies have been amalgamated given issues around data protection/ commercial sensitivity. I trust this information will further assist you as you seek to quickly consider the questions Andrew posed last week. Nonetheless, should you require further information please do contact me and we can discuss how those needs could best be met.

Kind regards,

Victor

Victor Dukelow

Analytical Services

Department for the Economy

Adelaide House

39-49 Adelaide Street

Belfast, BT2 8FD

Tel: 028 9025 7425 (ext: 57425)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9025 7425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



cid:image002.gif@01D23455.2CAFA9E0



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: Mark Cockburn

Sent: Thursday, 27 October 2016 14:32

To: McCormick, Andrew (DFE)

Cc: Cousins, Heather; Dukelow, Victor; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Stewart, Chris (DFE); Wightman, Stuart; Marten, Lucy; Murphy, Shane; Smith, Alan

Subject: RE: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

Dear Andrew

Thanks for these documents (although we already possess most of these - which are also public domain documents, or at least the CEPA reports).

From our invitation letter, my assumption is that the PAC want to discuss the two reports which set out initial and final recommendations on the tariffs that were introduced for the scheme. Although if you think that we will be asked to consider other issues it would be useful to know.

As you are aware, the NIAO report undertakes several analyses which purport to show that the absence of a two-tier tariff structure for small bio-mass (<100kw) from which subsequent problems then "all flowed". Understandably, we are keen to test the veracity of these claims.

To do this, we need access to the pertinent data. In particular, on an annual basis:

- Metered GWhs for different tariff bands of non-domestic biomass energy for which subsidies were paid out under the scheme, as well as the non-domestic total for all technologies
- Annual actual or forecasts expenditure for each category set out in the bullet point above.
- Breakdown of numbers of accredited installations and total MWh energy output by SIC code.

Whilst we're able to access equivalent GB data on these from BEIS and Ofgem, we don't seem to be able to find the equivalent NI data. Is this something that can be provided to us? If this is something that you don't have authority to provide, do you know if they are FOIable in NI?

We would really appreciate your assistance with these requests!

Kind regards

Mark

From: McCoy, Laura [<mailto:Laura.McCoy@economy-ni.gov.uk>] **On Behalf Of** McCormick, Andrew (DFE)
Sent: 26 October 2016 11:16
To: Mark Cockburn <mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>
Cc: Cousins, Heather <Heather.Cousins@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Dukelow, Victor <Victor.Dukelow@economy-ni.gov.uk>; McCann, Brendan <Brendan.McCann@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Woods, Michael (DFE) <Michael.Woods@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Stewart, Chris (DFE) <Chris.Stewart@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Wightman, Stuart <Stuart.Wightman@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Marten, Lucy <Lucy.Marten@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Murphy, Shane <Shane.Murphy@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Smith, Alan <Alan.Smith@economy-ni.gov.uk>
Subject: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

Mark

Please see attached correspondence from Andrew McCormick.

Regards,

Laura McCoy

Permanent Secretarys Office
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP
Tel: 028 9052 9200 (ext: 29200)
TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9200
Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



[cid:image002.gif@01D22F7B.EE24D5C0](#)



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: [Dukelow, Victor](#)
To: [Mark Cockburn](#)
Cc: [Cousins, Heather](#); [McCann, Brendan](#); [Woods, Michael \(DfE\)](#); [Stewart, Chris \(DFE\)](#); [Wightman, Stuart](#); [Marten, Lucy](#); [Murphy, Shane](#); [Smith, Alan](#); [McCormick, Andrew \(DFE\)](#)
Subject: RE: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive
Date: 03 November 2016 09:23:05
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[image002.gif](#)
[Cumulative active applications.xlsx](#)

Mark,

Please find attached a further spreadsheet with cumulative applications and capacity by SIC code up to and including 2015/16. There has been some further reduction in suppression although, the extent to which suppression remains serves to emphasise how volume uptake has been focused in a small number of sectors.

Kind regards,

Victor

From: Mark Cockburn [mailto:mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk]
Sent: 02 November 2016 15:55
To: Dukelow, Victor
Cc: Cousins, Heather; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Stewart, Chris (DFE); Wightman, Stuart; Marten, Lucy; Murphy, Shane; Smith, Alan; McCormick, Andrew (DFE)
Subject: RE: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

Victor

Thanks for responding so quickly. In terms of your last point it is just the cumulative by two digit categories for the life of the scheme, not for each year. I would imagine that if you did this most of the two digit categories it would reduce the suppression rates, giving a fuller picture of the distribution of installations.

Best wishes

Mark

From: Dukelow, Victor [mailto:Victor.Dukelow@economy-ni.gov.uk]
Sent: 02 November 2016 12:05
To: Mark Cockburn <mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>
Cc: Cousins, Heather <Heather.Cousins@economy-ni.gov.uk>; McCann, Brendan <Brendan.McCann@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Woods, Michael (DfE) <Michael.Woods@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Stewart, Chris (DFE) <Chris.Stewart@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Wightman, Stuart <Stuart.Wightman@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Marten, Lucy <Lucy.Marten@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Murphy, Shane <Shane.Murphy@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Smith, Alan <Alan.Smith@economy-ni.gov.uk>; McCormick, Andrew (DFE) <Andrew.McCormick@economy-ni.gov.uk>
Subject: RE: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

Mark,

Thank you for your reply.

Where it has been possible at this stage to provide answers to the questions you raise, these are set out below. Please do note that in relation to some of the questions around further analysis, we are seeking information from Ofgem and will come back to you once that is available. In relation to your final bullet point I would be keen to seek some additional clarification around how best to cut the data in order to best meet your needs.

I trust this is helpful in the interim.

Kind regards,

Victor

From: Mark Cockburn [<mailto:mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>]

Sent: 01 November 2016 16:12

To: Dukelow, Victor

Cc: Cousins, Heather; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Stewart, Chris (DFE); Wightman, Stuart; Marten, Lucy; Murphy, Shane; Smith, Alan; McCormick, Andrew (DFE)

Subject: RE: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

From: Mark Cockburn [<mailto:mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>]

Sent: 01 November 2016 16:12

To: Dukelow, Victor

Cc: Cousins, Heather; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Stewart, Chris (DFE); Wightman, Stuart; Marten, Lucy; Murphy, Shane; Smith, Alan; McCormick, Andrew (DFE)

Subject: RE: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

Dear Victor

Many thanks for sending this through. I just had a few queries:

- Can you confirm that what you term “middle solid biomass boilers” are those with a capacity of 20kW to 100kW scale, please.

Yes, middle solid biomass boilers are those with a capacity of 20kW to 100kW.

- Also in your first table, for each year, can you provide the **cumulative number of such installations** alongside the estimated expenditure and heat production figures please (I don't think that this will cause you to breach any confidentiality requirements). We would like to be able to work out what heat was generated on average by “middle solid biomass boilers”. I'm assuming that it is not possible to provide us with the annual distribution of heat output from boilers of a similar size?

We have reverted to Ofgem for a further breakdown and will forward when received.

- I can't reconcile the expenditure figures that you have produced with the annual expenditure figures for the RHI set out in the NIAO report. They are out by a significant amount?

The expenditure figures provided by Ofgem reflect actual payments made by them in each year, whilst those set out in the NIAO report include accruals and also includes an element for the domestic RHI.

- Are all other technologies included in “Other technologies”. If any are absent, could this help explain why the annual expenditure figures are different from the NIAO figures?
Yes, the other technologies are included in “other technologies”.

- Could you clarify why the heat generated numbers are just *estimated* numbers (at least up to 15/16) – is there not actual *metered* information available (for instance, from Ofgem)?

We have also reverted to Ofgem on this and will advise in due course.

- Finally, would it be possible to have the cumulative SIC code breakdowns please – this would reduce the number or compressed observations.

In Just to be clear - is it a cumulative for each two digit SIC code across all years that you would find helpful or a grouping up of disclosive SIC data within each year that would be most valuable? Due to small levels of take up in many two digit sectors, it is likely to be the latter approach (ie grossing up of SIC codes for each year) that will deliver most information to you.

It would be really useful if you were able to look into these points. In other areas we are making good progress on providing information for Friday. However, as regards the basis of the engineering numbers I have not had a response from the company that provided those to us, so I can't be sure that we can shed any more light on these issues.

Thanks again and best regards,

Mark

Mark Cockburn

Director

Cambridge Economic Policy Associates | Queens House, 55-56 Lincoln's Inn Fields, London, WC2A 3LJ |
T: +44 20 7269 0210 | M: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry | mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk | www.cepa.co.uk |
www.linkedin.com/company/cepa-ltd

From: Dukelow, Victor [<mailto:Victor.Dukelow@economy-ni.gov.uk>]

Sent: 01 November 2016 11:12

To: Mark Cockburn <mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>

Cc: Cousins, Heather <Heather.Cousins@economy-ni.gov.uk>; McCann, Brendan <Brendan.McCann@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Woods, Michael (DFE) <Michael.Woods@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Stewart, Chris (DFE) <Chris.Stewart@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Wightman, Stuart <Stuart.Wightman@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Marten, Lucy <Lucy.Marten@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Murphy, Shane <Shane.Murphy@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Smith, Alan <Alan.Smith@economy-ni.gov.uk>; McCormick, Andrew (DFE) <Andrew.McCormick@economy-ni.gov.uk>

Subject: RE: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

Mark,

Further your e-mail below which sought additional details on the Non-Domestic Renewable Heat

Incentive Scheme, please find attached an Excel spreadsheet which sets out payments made by technology, by year and by estimated heat output. A further table presents the number of boilers operating within the scheme and their capacity by SIC code and by year. You will note that data in a number of the cells have been suppressed and technologies have been amalgamated given issues around data protection/ commercial sensitivity. I trust this information will further assist you as you seek to quickly consider the questions Andrew posed last week. Nonetheless, should you require further information please do contact me and we can discuss how those needs could best be met.

Kind regards,

Victor

Victor Dukelow

Analytical Services

Department for the Economy

Adelaide House

39-49 Adelaide Street

Belfast, BT2 8FD

Tel: 028 9025 7425 (ext: 57425)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9025 7425

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk



cid:image002.gif@01D23455.2CAFA9E0



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: Mark Cockburn

Sent: Thursday, 27 October 2016 14:32

To: McCormick, Andrew (DFE)

Cc: Cousins, Heather; Dukelow, Victor; McCann, Brendan; Woods, Michael (DfE); Stewart, Chris (DFE); Wightman, Stuart; Marten, Lucy; Murphy, Shane; Smith, Alan

Subject: RE: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

Dear Andrew

Thanks for these documents (although we already possess most of these - which are also public domain documents, or at least the CEPA reports).

From our invitation letter, my assumption is that the PAC want to discuss the two reports which set out initial and final recommendations on the tariffs that were introduced for the scheme.

Although if you think that we will be asked to consider other issues it would be useful to know.

As you are aware, the NIAO report undertakes several analyses which purport to show that the absence of a two-tier tariff structure for small bio-mass (<100kw) from which subsequent problems then “all flowed”. Understandably, we are keen to test the veracity of these claims.

To do this, we need access to the pertinent data. In particular, on an annual basis:

- Metered GWhs for different tariff bands of non-domestic biomass energy for which subsidies were paid out under the scheme, as well as the non-domestic total for all technologies
- Annual actual or forecasts expenditure for each category set out in the bullet point above.
- Breakdown of numbers of accredited installations and total MWh energy output by SIC code.

Whilst we're able to access equivalent GB data on these from BEIS and Ofgem, we don't seem to be able to find the equivalent NI data. Is this something that can be provided to us? If this is something that you don't have authority to provide, do you know if they are FOIable in NI?

We would really appreciate your assistance with these requests!

Kind regards

Mark

From: McCoy, Laura [<mailto:Laura.McCoy@economy-ni.gov.uk>] **On Behalf Of** McCormick, Andrew (DFE)
Sent: 26 October 2016 11:16
To: Mark Cockburn <mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>
Cc: Cousins, Heather <Heather.Cousins@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Dukelow, Victor <Victor.Dukelow@economy-ni.gov.uk>; McCann, Brendan <Brendan.McCann@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Woods, Michael (DFE) <Michael.Woods@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Stewart, Chris (DFE) <Chris.Stewart@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Wightman, Stuart <Stuart.Wightman@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Marten, Lucy <Lucy.Marten@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Murphy, Shane <Shane.Murphy@economy-ni.gov.uk>; Smith, Alan <Alan.Smith@economy-ni.gov.uk>
Subject: Non-Domestic Renewable Heat Incentive

Mark

Please see attached correspondence from Andrew McCormick.

Regards,

Laura McCoy