

**From:** [Marten, Lucy](#)  
**To:** [Moore, Stephen \(DETI\)](#)  
**Subject:** FW: RHI Risk template  
**Date:** 23 June 2016 09:14:19  
**Attachments:** [image001.gif](#)  
[RHI Risk template.docx](#)

---

Stephen

Grateful if you could take a quick look at R8 in the attached risk template. Can you advise on Controls in Place and look at my comment in the Actions Planned section?

Many thanks

Lucy

## **Lucy Marten**

Energy Efficiency

Department for the Economy

Netherleigh

Massey Avenue

Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9251 (ext: 29251)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9251

Web: [www.economy-ni.gov.uk](http://www.economy-ni.gov.uk)



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

## **Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?**

---

**From:** McCann, Brendan

**Sent:** 22 June 2016 11:01

**To:** Clydesdale, Alison; Marten, Lucy; Woods, Michael (DETI)

**Subject:** RHI Risk template

All,

Please see attached a first draft of the Risk Register for the RHI Project. Can you please consider and add any additional material requested and return to me by close of play tomorrow so that I can issue to Steering Group members on Friday before lunch.

Thanks in anticipation.

Brendan

PROJECT RISK REGISTER: RENEWABLE HEAT INCENTIVE SCHEME

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R1	Widespread Non-compliance with the Scheme Rules	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Applications not checked for eligibility</li> <li>Claims submitted not checked for Compliance</li> <li>Monitoring visits not undertaken to required level</li> <li>Monitoring visits ineffective</li> <li>Poor Scheme Design</li> <li>Abuse by Scheme participants</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Eligibility checks conducted by OFGEM</li> <li>Monitoring visits / site inspections carried out by OFGEM</li> <li>MOU in place with OFGEM</li> </ul>	3	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Additional monitoring visits procured locally (revised NI Inspection Programme) (A Clydesdale - Dec16)</li> <li>Consultants appointed to assess the application of controls over the RHI Scheme (A Clydesdale / B. McCann / M. Woods - 10 July 2016)</li> </ul>

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R2	RHI Scheme is not affordable from 2016-17 to Scheme end in 2020	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Tariffs set too high</li> <li>Surge in applications during 2015-16</li> <li>No caps on number of applications</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Revised Tariffs in place for applicants approved from Nov 2015</li> <li>Scheme now closed to new applicants (Feb 2016)</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>Consultation on potential options to reduce costs (A Clydesdale – Sept 16)</u></li> <li>Revisited Tariffs / cost controls for all participants (A Clydesdale - Dec16)</li> <li>Revised Business Case (A Clydesdale - Dec 2016)</li> <li>Legislation for new Tariffs (A Clydesdale – Jan / Feb 2017)</li> </ul>

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.31 cm, No bullets or numbering

--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	

R3	Bid to cover Expenditure on 2016-17 not met	Alison Clydesdale / Stephen McMurray	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No available funding elsewhere in the Department</li> <li>Bid not met by DOF because of pressures in NI Block</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Quarterly Monitoring Rounds</li> <li>Bids to DOF for Additional Monies</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Cost controls considered (A Clydesdale - Dec16)</li> <li>Revised Business Case for Scheme until 2020 (A Clydesdale - Dec 2016)</li> <li>Submission of further bids through Monitoring Rounds / liaison with DOF (S McMurray – various)</li> </ul>
----	---	--------------------------------------	---	---	---	--	---	---	--

**Comment [LM1]:** Surely the likelihood is less than 4?

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	

R4	All DOF Approvals required are not secured	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Request not sent to DOF on time</li> <li>Retrospective approval is still not given</li> <li>All information not provided to enable DOF Decision</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Quality Assurance of submissions by Department Management</li> <li>Quality Assurance by Finance Division</li> <li>Casework Committee Scrutiny</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secure additional finance resource</li> <li>Develop revised cost controls / tariffs</li> <li>Develop Revised Business case with new tariffs for submission to DOF and Minister (A Clydesdale – by Mar 2017)</li> </ul>
----	--	-------------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment	Controls in Place	Assessment	Action Planned
				Inherent		Residual	

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R5	Revised Tariffs not agreed and in place from 1 April 2017 onwards	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Resistance from Participants</li> <li>Rates not agreed with DOF</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>RHI Steering Group established to oversee planning work</li> <li>Expertise available to develop revised tariffs</li> <li>Close working with DSO on emerging issues</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Case reduction measures to be developed and implemented from April 2017 (A Clydesdale – Mar 2017)</li> </ul>

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment	Controls in Place	Assessment	Action Planned
				Inherent		Residual	

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R6	Monitoring Visits not carried out to the required level	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inspections / visits not carried out because of a surge in demand</li> <li>Funding for Inspections / visits not available</li> <li>Backlog of Inspections / visits</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>MOU with OFGEM through which Ricardo is employed to carry out Inspections / visits</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Independent assessment of the scheme (A Clydesdale M Woods – xx 2016)</li> <li>Revised Northern Ireland Programme of visits planned (A Clydesdale – Sep 2016)</li> <li>Procurement of Organisation to carry out NI Programme of visits (A Clydesdale – xx 2016)</li> </ul>

Comment [LM2]: Is this true?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment	Controls in Place	Assessment	Action Planned
				Inherent		Residual	



				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R7	Department insufficiently prepared for PAC	Iain McFarlane	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of required staff resources</li> <li>Staff resources do not have the skills required</li> <li>Department fails to collect all information required</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Steering Group established / chaired by Perm Sec / Dep Perm Sec</li> <li>Staff with required skills on Steering Group</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Action Plan for project to be developed (B McCann / A Clydesdale – 30 June 2016)</li> <li>Preparation for PAC to be co-ordinated by Accountability and Casework Branch (I McFarlane)</li> </ul>

	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Inherent	Controls in Place	Residual	Action Planned

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R8	RHI Scheme does not comply with State Aid Rules	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Scheme tariffs breach return allowed under State Aid Rules</li> </ul>	3	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>DN: Alison to provide please</li> </ul>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>DN: Alison to provide please <u>Letter to Commission to outline position and possible actions</u></li> </ul> (A Clydesdale – <del>xx</del> July 16)

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R9	RHI Scheme is not value for money	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Tariffs set too high</li> <li>Return on Investment for participants higher than anticipated in original Business Case</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Original Business Case approved by DOF</li> </ul>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Independent Review of the Scheme by external consultants (B McCann / A Clydesdale – Jul-Sep 2016)</li> <li>Economist Evaluation of the Scheme</li> <li>Development of Cost Control measures</li> </ul>

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R10	Reputational Damage to the Department which Impacts on Future Schemes	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Complaints about Department's handling of the Scheme</li> <li>Perceived poor performance at PAC</li> <li>Widespread reporting of NIAO's comments on 2015-16 Accounts</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Steering Group established / chaired by Perm Sec / Dep Perm Sec</li> <li>DN: Alison to provide additional controls please</li> </ul>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>'Lines to take' developed and agreed with <b>Private Press</b> Office (L Martein – June 2016)</li> <li>Cascade of IA Findings to wider Department (B McCann – Aug 2016)</li> <li>Consultation on proposed changes (A Clydesdale – <del>xx</del>Sept 16)</li> </ul>

**From:** Moore, Stephen (DETI)  
**To:** [Marten, Lucy](#)  
**Cc:** [Kelly, Andrea](#); [Murphy, Shane](#)  
**Subject:** FW: RHI Risk template  
**Date:** 23 June 2016 15:44:00  
**Attachments:** [image001.gif](#)  
[RHI Risk template.docx](#)

---

Lucy

I have inserted some comments and (tracked) changes to R2, R5 and R8 for your consideration.

Happy to discuss.

Stephen

**Stephen Moore**

State Aid Unit  
Department for the Economy  
Netherleigh  
Massey Avenue  
Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9415 (ext: 29415)

Mob Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9415

Web: [www.economy-ni.gov.uk](http://www.economy-ni.gov.uk)

**NEW** - 'State aid: A Beginner's Guide for Public Bodies in Northern Ireland' can now be accessed through the DFE Internet site: <https://www.detini.gov.uk/publications/state-aid-beginners-guide-public-bodies-northern-ireland>



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

**Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?**

---

**From:** Marten, Lucy  
**Sent:** 23 June 2016 09:14  
**To:** Moore, Stephen (DETI)  
**Subject:** FW: RHI Risk template

Stephen

Grateful if you could take a quick look at R8 in the attached risk template. Can you advise on Controls in Place and look at my comment in the Actions Planned section?

Many thanks

Lucy

**Lucy Marten**

Energy Efficiency

Department for the Economy

Netherleigh

Massey Avenue

Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9251 (ext: 29251)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9251

Web: [www.economy-ni.gov.uk](http://www.economy-ni.gov.uk)



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

**Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?**

**From:** McCann, Brendan

**Sent:** 22 June 2016 11:01

**To:** Clydesdale, Alison; Marten, Lucy; Woods, Michael (DETI)

**Subject:** RHI Risk template

All,

Please see attached a first draft of the Risk Register for the RHI Project. Can you please consider and add any additional material requested and return to me by close of play tomorrow so that I can issue to Steering Group members on Friday before lunch.

Thanks in anticipation.

Brendan

PROJECT RISK REGISTER: RENEWABLE HEAT INCENTIVE SCHEME

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R1	Widespread Non-compliance with the Scheme Rules	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Applications not checked for eligibility</li> <li>• Claims submitted not checked for Compliance</li> <li>• Monitoring visits not undertaken to required level</li> <li>• Monitoring visits ineffective</li> <li>• Poor Scheme Design</li> <li>• Abuse by Scheme participants</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Eligibility checks conducted by OFGEM</li> <li>• Monitoring visits / site inspections carried out by OFGEM</li> <li>• MOU in place with OFGEM</li> </ul>	3	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Additional monitoring visits procured locally (revised NI Inspection Programme) (A Clydesdale - Dec16)</li> <li>• Consultants appointed to assess the application of controls over the RHI Scheme (A Clydesdale / B. McCann / M. Woods - 10 July 2016)</li> </ul>

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R2	RHI Scheme is not affordable from 2016-17 to Scheme end in 2020	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Tariffs set too high</li> <li>Surge in applications during 2015-16</li> <li>No caps on number of applications</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Revised Tariffs in place for applicants approved from Nov 2015</li> <li>Scheme now closed to new applicants (Feb 2016)</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consultation on potential options to reduce costs (A Clydesdale – Sept 16)</li> <li>Revisited Tariffs / cost controls for all participants (A Clydesdale - Dec16)</li> <li>Revised Business Case (A Clydesdale - Dec 2016)</li> <li>Legislation for new Tariffs (A Clydesdale – Jan / Feb 2017)</li> </ul>

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.31 cm, No bullets or numbering

Comment [SM1]: Not sure whether in addition to the State aid risk actions at R8 it is also necessary to state that a further action here would e to ...

Liaise with State aid unit, Departmental Solicitors Office, EC and other authorities, as necessary, to determine whether scheme is in breach of its approval decision (SA.34140) and the actions that need to be taken.



--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	

R3	Bid to cover Expenditure on 2016-17 not met	Alison Clydesdale / Stephen McMurray	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No available funding elsewhere in the Department</li> <li>Bid not met by DOF because of pressures in NI Block</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Quarterly Monitoring Rounds</li> <li>Bids to DOF for Additional Monies</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Cost controls considered (A Clydesdale - Dec16)</li> <li>Revised Business Case for Scheme until 2020 (A Clydesdale - Dec 2016)</li> <li>Submission of further bids through Monitoring Rounds / liaison with DOF (S McMurray – various)</li> </ul>
----	---	--------------------------------------	---	---	---	--	---	---	--

**Comment [LM2]:** Surely the likelihood is less than 4?

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	

R4	All DOF Approvals required are not secured	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Request not sent to DOF on time</li> <li>Retrospective approval is still not given</li> <li>All information not provided to enable DOF Decision</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Quality Assurance of submissions by Department Management</li> <li>Quality Assurance by Finance Division</li> <li>Casework Committee Scrutiny</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secure additional finance resource</li> <li>Develop revised cost controls / tariffs</li> <li>Develop Revised Business case with new tariffs for submission to DOF and Minister</li> </ul> <p>(A Clydesdale – by Mar 2017)</p>
----	--	-------------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	--

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment	Controls in Place	Assessment	Action Planned
				Inherent		Residual	

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R5	Revised Tariffs not agreed and in place from 1 April 2017 onwards	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Resistance from Participants</li> <li>Rates not agreed with DOF</li> <li><u>EC State aid approval for revised tariffs not obtained</u></li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>RHI Steering Group established to oversee planning work</li> <li>Expertise available to develop revised tariffs</li> <li>Close working with DSO on emerging issues</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Case reduction measures to be developed and implemented from April 2017 (A Clydesdale – Mar 2017)</li> </ul>

**Comment [SM3]:** In addition to the State aid risk actions at R8 it is also necessary to state that a further action here would e to ...

Liaise with State aid unit, Departmental Solicitors Office, EC and other authorities, as necessary, to determine whether scheme is in breach of its approval decision (SA.34140) and the actions that need to be taken.

A Clydesdale – July 2016

**Formatted:** Font: (Default) Arial, 10

**Formatted:** Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, No bullets or numbering

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment	Controls in Place	Assessment	Action Planned
				Inherent		Residual	

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R6	Monitoring Visits not carried out to the required level	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inspections / visits not carried out because of a surge in demand</li> <li>Funding for Inspections / visits not available</li> <li>Backlog of Inspections / visits</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>MOU with OFGEM through which Ricardo is employed to carry out Inspections / visits</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Independent assessment of the scheme (A Clydesdale M Woods – xx 2016)</li> <li>Revised Northern Ireland Programme of visits planned (A Clydesdale – Sep 2016)</li> <li>Procurement of Organisation to carry out NI Programme of visits (A Clydesdale – xx 2016)</li> </ul>

Comment [LM4]: Is this true?

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment	Controls in Place	Assessment	Action Planned
				Inherent		Residual	

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R7	Department insufficiently prepared for PAC	Iain McFarlane	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of required staff resources</li> <li>Staff resources do not have the skills required</li> <li>Department fails to collect all information required</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Steering Group established / chaired by Perm Sec / Dep Perm Sec</li> <li>Staff with required skills on Steering Group</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Action Plan for project to be developed (B McCann / A Clydesdale – 30 June 2016)</li> <li>Preparation for PAC to be co-ordinated by Accountability and Casework Branch (I McFarlane)</li> </ul>

	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Inherent	Controls in Place	Residual	Action Planned

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R8	RHI Scheme does not comply with <u>European Commission State Aid approval decision (SA.34140)</u> with the consequence that the scheme is illegal <u>Rules</u>	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>Scheme tariffs breach return allowed under State Aid Rules</u></li> <li><u>The EC adopts a decision that the scheme is in breach of its approval decision</u></li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>DN: Alison to provide please Relevant staff understand and ensure compliance with the terms and conditions of the EC's State aid approval decision (SA.34140).</u></li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>DN: Alison to provide please Letter to Commission to outline position and possible actions</u> liaise with State aid unit, Departmental Solicitors Office, EC and other authorities, as necessary, to determine whether scheme is in breach of its approval decision (SA.34140) and the actions that need to be taken.</li> <li><u>Undertake regular reviews of the scheme to ensure it remains in compliance with its State aid approval decision (SA.34140) or any revised EC approval decision.</u></li> </ul> <p>(A Clydesdale – <del>xx</del>July 16)</p>

Formatted Table

Formatted: Font: Not Italic

Formatted: Font: Not Italic

Formatted: Font: Italic

Formatted: Font: Not Italic

--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	



R9	RHI Scheme is not value for money	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Tariffs set too high</li> <li>Return on Investment for participants higher than anticipated in original Business Case</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Original Business Case approved by DOF</li> </ul>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Independent Review of the Scheme by external consultants (B McCann / A Clydesdale – Jul-Sep 2016)</li> <li>Economist Evaluation of the Scheme</li> <li>Development of Cost Control measures</li> </ul>
----	-----------------------------------	-------------------	---	---	---	--	--	--	---

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment	Controls in Place	Assessment	Action Planned
				Inherent		Residual	

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R10	Reputational Damage to the Department which Impacts on Future Schemes	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Complaints about Department's handling of the Scheme</li> <li>Perceived poor performance at PAC</li> <li>Widespread reporting of NIAO's comments on 2015-16 Accounts</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Steering Group established / chaired by Perm Sec / Dep Perm Sec</li> <li>DN: Alison to provide additional controls please</li> </ul>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>'Lines to take' developed and agreed with <u>Private Press</u> Office (L Martein – June 2016)</li> <li>Cascade of IA Findings to wider Department (B McCann – Aug 2016)</li> <li>Consultation on proposed changes (A Clydesdale – <del>xx</del>Sept 16)</li> </ul>

**From:** [Marten, Lucy](#)  
**To:** [Moore, Stephen \(DETI\)](#)  
**Subject:** FW: RHI Risk template  
**Date:** 23 June 2016 15:57:26  
**Attachments:** [image001.gif](#)  
[RHI Risk template.docx](#)

---

Stephen

As discussed.

Thanks

Lucy

**Lucy Marten**

Energy Efficiency

Department for the Economy

Netherleigh

Massey Avenue

Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 028 9052 9251 (ext: 29251)

Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9251

Web: [www.economy-ni.gov.uk](http://www.economy-ni.gov.uk)



[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

**Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?**

---

**From:** McCann, Brendan

**Sent:** 22 June 2016 11:01

**To:** Clydesdale, Alison; Marten, Lucy; Woods, Michael (DETI)

**Subject:** RHI Risk template

All,

Please see attached a first draft of the Risk Register for the RHI Project. Can you please consider and add any additional material requested and return to me by close of play tomorrow so that I can issue to Steering Group members on Friday before lunch.

Thanks in anticipation.

Brendan

PROJECT RISK REGISTER: RENEWABLE HEAT INCENTIVE SCHEME

1 Identifier	2 Risk	3 Risk Owner	4 Cause of Risk	5 Assessment		6 Controls in Place	7 Assessment		8 Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R1	<del>Widespread</del> Non-compliance with the Scheme Rules	Alison Clydesdale and Michael Woods	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Applications not checked for eligibility</li> <li>Claims submitted not checked for Compliance</li> <li>Monitoring visits not undertaken to required level</li> <li>Monitoring visits ineffective</li> <li>Poor Scheme Design</li> <li>Abuse by Scheme participants</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Eligibility checks conducted by OFGEM</li> <li>Monitoring visits / site inspections carried out by OFGEM</li> <li>MOU in place with OFGEM</li> <li><a href="#">Internal Audit report ongoing</a></li> <li><a href="#">Implementation of recommendations from Internal Audit report</a></li> </ul>	3	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Additional monitoring visits procured locally (revised NI Inspection Programme) (A Clydesdale / L Marten - Dec16)</li> <li>Consultants appointed to assess the application of controls over the RHI Scheme (A Clydesdale / B. McCann / M. Woods - 10 July 2016)</li> <li><a href="#">Implementation of recommendations from Internal Audit report (A Clydesdale/L Marten - Jan 17) -</a></li> </ul>

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: List Paragraph, Indent: Left: 0 cm, Hanging: 0.31 cm, Space Before: 0 pt, Bulleted + Level: 1 + Aligned at: 0.95 cm + Indent at: 1.58 cm, Tab stops: Not at -0.25 cm + 0.25 cm

Formatted: List Paragraph, Space Before: 0 pt, Tab stops: Not at -0.25 cm + 0.25 cm

--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	

R2	RHI Scheme is not affordable from 2016-17 to Scheme end in 2020	Alison Clydesdale / Stephen McMurray	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Tariffs set too high</li> <li>Surge in applications during 2015-16</li> <li>No <del>cost control caps on number of applications</del> <u>measures in place.</u></li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Revised Tariffs in place for applicants approved from Nov 2015</li> <li>Scheme now closed to new applicants (Feb 2016)</li> <li><u>Budget Monitoring / Forecasting process established .</u></li> <li><u>Additional dedicated finance resource for renewable heat branch.</u></li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>Consultation on potential options to introduce cost control measures - reduce costs</del></li> <li><del>(A Clydesdale /L Marten - Oct Sept 16)</del></li> <li><del>Revisited Tariffs / cost controls for all participants)</del></li> <li><del>(A Clydesdale - Dec16)</del></li> <li>Revised Business Case (A Clydesdale - Dec 2016)</li> <li>Legislation for new Tariffs (A Clydesdale – Jan / Feb 2017)</li> <li><u>Additional dedicated finance resource for renewable heat branch.</u></li> <li><u>(Stephen McMurray – July 2016)</u></li> </ul>
----	---	--------------------------------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	--

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.31 cm, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, No bullets or numbering

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R3	Bid to cover Expenditure on 2016-17 not met	<del>Alison Clydesdale</del> / Stephen McMurray	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No available funding elsewhere in the Department</li> <li>Bid not met by DOF because of pressures in NI Block</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Quarterly Monitoring Rounds</li> <li>Bids to DOF for Additional Monies</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consultation on potential Cost controls measures considered (A Clydesdale / L Marten - <del>Oct - Dec16</del>)</li> <li>Revised Business Case for Scheme until 2020 (A Clydesdale - Dec 2016)</li> <li>Submission of further bids through Monitoring Rounds / liaison with DOF (S McMurray – various)</li> </ul>

Comment [LM1]: Surely the likelihood is less than 4? Brendan agreed to change to 3.

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R4	All DOF Approvals required are not secured	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Request not sent to DOF on time</li> <li>Retrospective approval is still not given</li> <li>All information not provided to enable DOF Decision</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Quality Assurance of submissions by Department Management</li> <li>Quality Assurance by Finance Division</li> <li>Casework Committee Scrutiny</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secure additional finance resource – <a href="#">Stephen McMurray July 16</a></li> <li>Develop <a href="#">consultation proposals for potential</a> revised cost controls / tariffs</li> <li>Develop Revised Business case with new tariffs for submission to DOF and Minister (A Clydesdale – by Mar 2017)</li> </ul>



--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	

R5	Revised Tariffs not agreed and in place from 1 April 2017 onwards	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>Ongoing legal challenges prevent legislation being made .</u></li> <li>Resistance from Participants</li> <li>Rates not agreed with DOF</li> <li><u>Assembly Committee does not agree raises concerns regarding the proposed cost control measures</u></li> <li><u>Assembly does not pass the legislation</u></li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>RHI Steering Group established to oversee planning work</li> <li>Expertise available to develop revised tariffs</li> <li>Close working with DSO on emerging issues</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>Consultation on proposed cost Case</u> reduction measures to be developed.</li> <li><del>and implemented</del> <u>Legislation in place</u> from April 2017 (A Clydesdale – Mar 2017)</li> </ul>
----	---	-------------------	---	---	---	--	---	---	---

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.31 cm, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, No bullets or numbering

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Ident ifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment	Controls in Place	Assessment	Action Planned
				Inherent		Residual	

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R6	Monitoring Visits not carried out to the required level	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Inspections / visits not carried out because of a surge in demand</li> <li>Funding for Inspections / visits not available</li> <li>Backlog of Inspections / visits</li> <li>Unable to procure a 3<sup>rd</sup> party provider</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>MOU with OFGEM through which Ricardo is employed to carry out Inspections / visits</li> <li>Business as usual site inspection programme agreed with Ofgem</li> <li>Procurement of 3<sup>rd</sup> party audit provider.</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Independent assessment of the scheme (A Clydesdale/ B McCann/ M Woods – xx 2016)</li> <li>Revised Northern Ireland Programme of visits planned (A Clydesdale – <del>Oct Sep</del> 2016)</li> <li>Procurement of 3rd party provider Organisation to carry out NI Programme of visits to be in place by 1 April 2017. (A Clydesdale – <del>xx</del> 2016 Feb 2017)</li> </ul>

Formatted: Normal, Indent: Left: 0 cm

Comment [LM2]: Is this true?

Formatted: Superscript

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Superscript

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R7	Department insufficiently prepared for PAC	Iain McFarlane / Terry Coyne	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lack of required staff resources</li> <li>Staff resources do not have the skills required</li> <li>Department fails to collect all information required</li> </ul>	4	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Steering Group established / chaired by Perm Sec / Dep Perm Sec</li> <li>Staff with required skills on Steering Group</li> <li>Mock PAC panels to be established</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Action Plan for project to be developed (B McCann / A Clydesdale – 30 June 2016)</li> <li>Preparation for PAC, including mock PAC panels, to be co-ordinated by Accountability and Casework Branch (I McFarlane)</li> </ul>

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, Space Before: 0 pt, No bullets or numbering

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility Target Date
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	
R8	RHI Scheme does not comply with State Aid Rules	Alison Clydesdale / Stephen Moore	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Scheme tariffs breach return allowed under State Aid Rules</li> <li>Staff resources do not have the skills required</li> </ul>	3	2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><del>DN: Alison to provide please</del></li> <li>Steering Group established / chaired by Perm Sec / Dep Perm Sec</li> <li>Staff with required skills on Steering Group</li> <li>Ongoing liaison with EU state Aid branch</li> </ul>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Discussions with DECC state aid unit and RHI teams</li> <li>Discussions with BIS / UKRep <del>DN: Alison to provide please</del></li> <li>Letter Paper to inform informal discussion with the <del>to</del> Commission to outline position and possible actions (A Clydesdale / S Moore - <del>xx</del> Sep July 16)</li> <li>Fomal lettre to commission setting out issues.</li> </ul>

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.31 cm, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Body Text Indent 3, Tab stops: -0.25 cm, Left + 0.31 cm, Left

--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

1	2	3	4	5		6	7		8
Identifier	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Assessment		Controls in Place	Assessment		Action Planned & Responsibility <i>Target Date</i>
				Inherent			Residual		
				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	

R9	RHI Scheme is not value for money	Alison Clydesdale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Tariffs set too high</li> <li>Return on Investment for participants higher than anticipated in original Business Case</li> <li>No budget available for external value for money study</li> <li>Legal challenge to potential cost control measures</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Original Business Case approved by DOF</li> </ul>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Independent Review of the Scheme by external consultants (B McCann / A Clydesdale – Jul-Sep 2016)</li> <li>Economist Evaluation of the Scheme</li> <li>Consultation on potential Development of Cost Control measures</li> </ul>
----	-----------------------------------	-------------------	---	---	---	--	--	--	---

	Risk	Risk Owner	Cause of Risk	Inherent	Controls in Place	Residual	Action Planned

				Impact	Likelihood		Impact	Likelihood	& Responsibility Target Date
R10	Reputational Damage to the Department which Impacts on Future Schemes	<a href="#">Alison Clydesdale / Stephen McMurray</a>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Complaints about Department's handling of the Scheme</li> <li>Perceived poor performance at PAC</li> <li>Widespread reporting of NIAO's comments on 2015-16 Accounts</li> <li>Ongoing legal challenge on proposed cost control measures.</li> </ul>	4	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Steering Group established / chaired by Perm Sec / Dep Perm Sec</li> <li>Establishment of a Project Management Office to review cost control measures for future schemes</li> <li>DN: Alison to provide additional controls please</li> </ul>			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>'Lines to take' developed and agreed with <a href="#">Private Press Office</a> (L Marten – June 2016)</li> <li>Cascade of IA Findings to wider Department (B McCann – Aug 2016)</li> <li>Consultation on proposed cost control measures changes</li> <li>(A Clydesdale – <del>xx</del>Oct Sept 16)</li> <li>Establishment of a Project Management Office to review cost control measures for future schemes (A Clydesdale/L Marten – Oct 2016)</li> </ul>

Formatted: No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10

Formatted: Justified, Indent: Left: 1.27 cm, Space Before: 0 pt, No bullets or numbering

Formatted: Indent: Left: 0.31 cm, First line: 0 cm, Bulleted + Level: 1 + Aligned at: 0.94 cm + Indent at: 1.58 cm

Formatted: Body Text Indent 3, Tab stops: -0.25 cm, Left + 0.31 cm, Left