

Wesley Aston

---

**From:** Wesley Aston  
**Sent:** 03 January 2017 21:59  
**To:** Andrew Crawford  
**Subject:** Fwd: RHI emails  
**Attachments:** 20161219170428169.pdf; ATT00001.txt; 20161219170457931.pdf

**Christopher Osborne**

---

**From:** Tom Forgrave Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry  
**Sent:** 09 July 2015 11:20  
**To:** Christopher Osborne  
**Subject:** RE: proposed changes to nirhi

Mr Wightman

I appreciate you coming back to me so quickly but I'm not sure it was the reasoned response I was looking for. The poultry industry is the largest employer in the private sector in NI and is integral to the agricultural industry in NI. It seems that in representing DETI the needs of such an important part of our economy are not being taken seriously by you or your peers.

The NIRHI when it was introduced was seen as very much a forward moving step and although GB were allowed up to a 199kw boiler, which really suited the poultry industry, we were limited to a 99kw boiler. This was insufficient for the heat demand required in our poultry sheds but it worked because it was only a single tier system.

Now we are being told, at extremely short notice, that not only do you wish to put us on a 2 tier system but that there is a possibility that it will continue to be limited to 99kw. As I've outlined already, to move to a 2 tier system at short notice will play havoc with the current building programme but to limit it to 99kw will stop biomass installations dead in their tracks. How does DETI envisage us hitting our targets for renewable heat by 2020?

I may not be in agreement with moving to a 2 tier system but if it mirrors that which is already in place in GB then I can't argue against it. If however you wish to make it up as you go along and pluck numbers out of the air and limit us to a 99kw boiler on 1341hrs/annum then some very serious consultation will be needed. The industry will need time to give their response.

---

**From:** Stuart.Wightman@detini.gov.uk  
**To:** tom.forgrave@Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry  
**Date:** Thu, 9 Jul 2015 09:19:16 +0100  
**Subject:** RE: proposed changes to nirhi

I'm not buying this!!

St

---

**From:** Tom Forgrave [mailto:Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry]  
**Sent:** 08 July 2015 23:04  
**To:** Wightman, Stuart; Hughes, Seamus; Sinton, Dan  
**Subject:** proposed changes to nirhi

Dear Mssrs Wightman, Hughes and Sinton

Regarding the proposed changes to NIRHI being discussed at the present time could I please ask that you give consideration to not rushing through any changes. The proposed date of 1st Oct 15 does not give the poultry industry in NI time to adapt to a new tariff.

The poultry industry has a particularly large heat requirement and the NIRHI has proven to be very effective at encouraging farmers to be more environmentally sustainable and in reducing our dependence on fossil fuels, primarily LPG.

Many farmers, myself included, are in the planning process to build new poultry sheds for Moypark. This is a long and complicated process with a timeframe of anywhere between 6 and 12 months from planning applications being submitted to biomass boilers being commissioned and chickens placed in sheds. Cash flow projections have been presented to banks to prove the ability to repay loans of between £350k and £1m over a 10 yr period. These cash flow projections were submitted based on including an NIRHI of 6.3p/kw (pre-April 15) alongside the income from the poultry.

If the proposed 2 tier tariff system is implemented before these new sheds are passed by planning, cash flows will not match the projections submitted to the banks and it will put in serious jeopardy the viability of many of these expansion plans. The banks may reconsider their loan offers and farmers may not be able to proceed with their planned expansion.

We fully appreciate that tariffs may have to mirror what is already in place in mainland UK and that a 2 tier payment structure is a proven model. What we would ask is for a period of grace to be put in place for those who are currently in the process of planning or building. If it is impractical for this period to remain open-ended could the 1st Jan 2016 be considered as a realistic date for the change to be implemented?

Regards

Tom Forgrave

Chairman of Moypark Growers Committee (Ballymena)

Vice-Chair UFU Poultry Committee

**Christopher Osborne**

---

**From:** Tom Forgrave <Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry>  
**Sent:** 09 July 2015 11:09  
**To:** Christopher Osborne  
**Subject:** RE: proposed changes to nirhi

Chris

I thought it was a very abrupt response, I was looking for a bit of a debate.

I think they are determined to save money and have made their minds up already. I don't think they want to be challenged or to have to enter into debate.

The proposed changes will alter dramatically the pay back period for such a huge capital spend.

Tom

---

**From:** christopher@ufuhq.com  
**To:** tom.forgrave@Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry  
**Subject:** RE: proposed changes to nirhi  
**Date:** Thu, 9 Jul 2015 10:03:52 +0000

Tom,

What does he mean by "I'm not buying this".

Of course I will support the delay, I will get to work on my submission asap.

C

---

**From:** Tom Forgrave [mailto:Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry]  
**Sent:** 09 July 2015 10:58  
**To:** Christopher Osborne  
**Subject:** FW: proposed changes to nirhi

Hi Chris

Following on from our conversation regarding the NIRHI changes proposed for 1st Oct I sent the email below to DETI. I wasn't impressed with the response I received.

I know you are up to your eyes with NI ROC's but is there any chance UFU could throw a little weight behind the poultry sector to try and delay the proposed changes? I think DETI want to finalise their plans today or tomorrow so as to make an announcement post holidays.

Regards

Tom

---

From: [Stuart.Wightman@detini.gov.uk](mailto:Stuart.Wightman@detini.gov.uk)

To: [tom.forgrave@](mailto:tom.forgrave@) Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

Date: Thu, 9 Jul 2015 09:19:16 +0100

Subject: RE: proposed changes to nirhi  
I'm not buying this!!

St

---

From: Tom Forgrave [<mailto:> Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry]

Sent: 08 July 2015 23:04

To: Wightman, Stuart; Hughes, Seamus; Sinton, Dan

Subject: proposed changes to nirhi

Dear Msrs Wightman, Hughes and Sinton

Regarding the proposed changes to NIRHI being discussed at the present time could I please ask that you give consideration to not rushing through any changes. The proposed date of 1st Oct 15 does not give the poultry industry in NI time to adapt to a new tariff.

The poultry industry has a particularly large heat requirement and the NIRHI has proven to be very effective at encouraging farmers to be more environmentally sustainable and in reducing our dependence on fossil fuels, primarily LPG.

Many farmers, myself included, are in the planning process to build new poultry sheds for Moypark. This is a long and complicated process with a timeframe of anywhere between 6 and 12 months from planning applications being submitted to biomass boilers being commissioned and chickens placed in sheds. Cash flow projections have been presented to banks to prove the ability to repay loans of between £350k and £1m over a 10 yr period. These cash flow projections were submitted based on including an NIRHI of 6.3p/kw (pre-April 15) alongside the income from the poultry.

If the proposed 2 tier tariff system is implemented before these new sheds are passed by planning, cash flows will not match the projections submitted to the banks and it will put in serious jeopardy the viability of many of these expansion plans. The banks may reconsider their loan offers and farmers may not be able to proceed with their planned expansion.

We fully appreciate that tariffs may have to mirror what is already in place in mainland UK and that a 2 tier payment structure is a proven model. What we would ask is for a period of grace to be put in place for those who are currently in the process of planning or building. If it is impractical for this period to remain open-ended could the 1st Jan 2016 be considered as a realistic date for the change to be implemented?

Regards

Tom Forgrave

Chairman of Moypark Growers Committee (Ballymena)

Vice-Chair UFU Poultry Committee

**Christopher Osborne**

---

**From:** Tom Forgrave Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry  
**Sent:** 06 March 2015 14:35  
**To:** Christopher Osborne  
**Subject:** RE: RHI

Thanks Chris

I'm glad that UFU are fully behind the RHI. It really is a huge boost for the sector.

The reason I asked last night was that some personal opinions were coming to the fore and conversations were being had with those in authority undermining the whole RHI scheme.

I just wanted clarification that office bearers representing UFU policy didn't let personal opinion lead them when in discussions with policy makers.

Regards

Tom

---

**From:** christopher@ufuhq.com  
**To:** tom.forgrave@ Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry  
**Subject:** RHI  
**Date:** Fri, 6 Mar 2015 13:57:59 +0000

Good afternoon Tom,

I gather from Ivor Ferguson there was a discussion last night surrounding the UFU position on Biomass boilers. The UFU are fully supportive of the RHI and we are aware of the positive impact upon the heating of poultry houses.

Please refer below to the UFU submission to DETI on 3 October 2011, when responding to Development of the Northern Ireland Renewable Heat Incentive.

**Q3.7 – Do you agree with the proposed tariff level and standards?**

As far as biomass boilers are concerned, the NI non-domestic tariff is out of line with GB. Not just the tariff values but also the break even points. The UFU wishes to know why several technologies have differing levels of break support in NI compared to GB.

Anytime we have met DETI since we have said that NI should be in line with GB in terms of RHI support, however, our hands are tied to a certain extent by the small amount of money available compared to GB, £25m in NI compared to £898m in GB.

Feel free to give me a ring if you have any questions.

Chris Osborne  
Senior Policy Officer

**Christopher Osborne**

---

**From:** Hughes, Seamus <Seamus.Hughes@detini.gov.uk>  
**Sent:** 10 July 2015 12:07  
**To:** Christopher Osborne  
**Subject:** RE: Proposed changes to the NIRHI

Chris

That's great, see you then.

Regards

Seamus

**Seamus Hughes**  
Energy Efficiency Branch  
Department of Enterprise, Trade & Investment  
Netherleigh  
Massey Avenue  
Belfast, BT4 2JP  
Tel: 028 9052 9532 (ext: 29532)  
TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9532  
Web: www.detini.gov.uk

**Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?**

---

**From:** Christopher Osborne [mailto:christopher@ufuhq.com]  
**Sent:** 10 July 2015 11:52  
**To:** Hughes, Seamus  
**Subject:** RE: Proposed changes to the NIRHI

22 July at 10.30am suits best, see you then.

C

---

**From:** Hughes, Seamus [mailto:Seamus.Hughes@detini.gov.uk]  
**Sent:** 10 July 2015 11:48  
**To:** Christopher Osborne  
**Subject:** RE: Proposed changes to the NIRHI

Hi Chris

There will be no changes before 1<sup>st</sup> October.

Regards

Seamus

**Seamus Hughes**  
Energy Efficiency Branch  
Department of Enterprise, Trade & Investment  
Netherleigh  
Massey Avenue  
Belfast, BT4 2JP  
Tel: 028 9052 9532 (ext: 29532)

TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9532  
Web: [www.detini.gov.uk](http://www.detini.gov.uk)

**Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?**

**From:** Christopher Osborne [<mailto:christopher@ufuhq.com>]  
**Sent:** 10 July 2015 11:43  
**To:** Hughes, Seamus  
**Subject:** RE: Proposed changes to the NIRHI

Many thanks Seamus, 22 or 23 July will suit, but need to double check with Ivor and Tom as to which one suits best and I will get back to you.

One point whilst I am talking to you, a concern raised by one of our members concerns the timescale for introducing the new pricing system. I was led to believe that it would be 1<sup>st</sup> October 2015, but another contact told me it would be introduced sooner. Could you clarify the timescale?

Many thanks again.

C

---

**From:** Hughes, Seamus [<mailto:Seamus.Hughes@detini.gov.uk>]  
**Sent:** 10 July 2015 11:39  
**To:** Christopher Osborne  
**Cc:** Wightman, Stuart  
**Subject:** RE: Proposed changes to the NIRHI

Good morning Chris

Stuart and I would be happy to meet with you and your colleagues. Would either Wednesday 22 or Thursday 23 in the morning, say 10.30 am suit you?

Regards

Seamus

**Seamus Hughes**  
Energy Efficiency Branch  
Department of Enterprise, Trade & Investment  
Netherleigh  
Massey Avenue  
Belfast, BT4 2JP  
Tel: 028 9052 9532 (ext: 29532)  
TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9532  
Web: [www.detini.gov.uk](http://www.detini.gov.uk)

**Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?**

**From:** Christopher Osborne [<mailto:christopher@ufuhq.com>]  
**Sent:** 10 July 2015 07:38  
**To:** Hughes, Seamus  
**Subject:** RE: Proposed changes to the NIRHI

Good morning Seamus,

The UFU Poultry Committee met last night and in light of the changes to the NIRHI they have requested a meeting with DETI. Would it be possible to arrange this asap? I am conscious of holidays etc but we are flexible for the next couple of weeks. Would it be possible to look at the week commencing 20 July? The UFU team would consist of myself, Tom Forgrave (Poultry Chair) and Ivor Ferguson (Deputy President).



I look forward to hearing from you.

Chris

---

**From:** Hughes, Seamus [<mailto:Seamus.Hughes@detini.gov.uk>]  
**Sent:** 09 July 2015 13:58  
**To:** Christopher Osborne  
**Cc:** Wightman, Stuart  
**Subject:** RE: Proposed changes to the NIRHI

Good afternoon Chris

Thank you for your email.

We have been taking views from Moypark and a range of stakeholders over recent days including what has come forward from UFU and are currently assessing those views and how we might move forward. The potential for a grace period is a difficult one given that we are currently already over budget and this position needs to be addressed urgently. That said we are of course understanding of people who have already made commitments and we will do what we can to assist those in this position so that they are not disadvantaged. In terms of consultation, DETI consulted formally on the phase 2 review of the RHI in late 2013 and this included proposals for cost control. It is the outworking from this consultation that is being taken forward now.

We will keep you informed on developments over the coming weeks.

Regards

Seamus

**Seamus Hughes**  
Energy Efficiency Branch  
Department of Enterprise, Trade & Investment  
Netherleigh  
Massey Avenue  
Belfast, BT4 2JP  
Tel: 028 9052 9532 (ext: 29532)  
TextRelay: 18001 028 9052 9532  
Web: [www.detini.gov.uk](http://www.detini.gov.uk)

---

**Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?**

**From:** Christopher Osborne [<mailto:christopher@ufuhq.com>]  
**Sent:** 09 July 2015 11:26  
**To:** Hughes, Seamus  
**Cc:** Wightman, Stuart  
**Subject:** Proposed changes to the NIRHI

Good morning Seamus,

I trust you are well.

It has been brought to my attention that changes are due to be introduced for the NIRHI on 1 October 2015. The UFU would have welcomed the opportunity to contribute for the debate on these changes and I am led to believe that a decision is being made before the summer recess and we are disappointed that we were not consulted. In light of the short notice, the UFU are calling upon DETI to consider a grace period for farmers and landowners who are in the planning process or are nearing completion of a renewable heating project.

In addition, I am led to believe that our Poultry Chairman wrote to DETI to set out his concerns and the reply he was blunt and unhelpful, " I am not buying this". In my 10 years of dealing with Northern Ireland government departments I do not recall reading such a dismissive and rude correspondence and our Chairman is entitled to feel aggrieved at this unprofessional attitude.

I look forward to hearing your thoughts.

Chris Osborne  
Senior Policy Officer  
Dairy and Rural Enterprise