

Re: A personal note

Kirby Owen

Thu 17/11/2016 11:40

To: Willy Rickett - External Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry;

Indeed. As they say: "tomorrow's another day". (Was that Gone with the Wind?)

But I do rather think (and this is not a hint to you) that somebody, some day, should remind Mark who his friends are.

Kirby Owen

Director

Tel: +44 20 7269 0210

Kirby.Owen@cepa.co.uk

This email is confidential and any unauthorised use or disclosure is prohibited.

From: William Rickett Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry
Sent: 17 November 2016 11:39:13
To: Kirby Owen
Subject: Re: A personal note

Thanks Kirby. I would not rule out being at Tuesday's rehearsal. I would find it useful. See how it goes ...

W

Willy Rickett

Sent from my iPhone

On 17 Nov 2016, at 11:30, Kirby Owen <kirby.owen@cepa.co.uk> wrote:

Thanks Willy.

Of course, ever consequence, at least for adults. Indeed, I sat and thought for a full 5 minutes (considering among other things consequences!) before on on my reply which had the final para addressing his point.

In the short term, I rather doubt that I will be helpful to appear at next Tuesday's mee at the moment am not planning to do so.

BTW, I really meant the comments on your revise of his opening statement -- it is really very good. And if he doesn't get to give an opening statement, then the final set of bullet points, and the 3 par ession are useful in themselves as aides-memoire for later answers. (pretty sure that's duff French spelling there, but that's that.)

Kirby Owen

Director

Provided by CEPA on 10th May 2017

Tel: +44 20 7269 0210

Kirby.Owen@cepa.co.uk

This email is confidential and any unauthorised use or disclosure is prohibited.

From: William Rickett [Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry]
Sent: 17 November 2016 10:57:00
To: Kirby Owen
Subject: Re: A personal note

Mark was out of order in accusing you of sanctimony. And he probably regrets it. But he is facing a very difficult and unpleasant experience about which he can't do very much. So bear with him and count to ten, as my grandmother would say...

I am about to circulate a revised set of opening remarks and we should concentrate on getting them as right as we can. Probably best to focus comments on them rather than PwC or anything else.

W

William Rickett CB [Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry]

On Thu, Nov 17, 2016 at 10:37 AM, Kirby Owen <kirby.owen@cepa.co.uk> wrote:

Willy,

see Mark's original email (to which I just replied) below. Please focus on his "PS".

I certainly agree that I have tried to keep the tone a bit light in some of my remarks. But I am furious (even considering the fact that this is the first time Mark has been in this sort of situation). One could easily have said that about David's early remarks on all this as well, though (to my knowledge) nobody did.

I rather doubt a repeat of my presence at a "re-do" of Tuesday will be useful. Give it some thought and let's see what Mark comes back with.

If you have any personal counselling for me, don't hold back. But frankly, I see myself as trying to explain to people in simple terms what the "problem" with the 2nd report was. And nobody (especially mark) likes to have problems pointed out. But again, if you have counselling, I'm glad to listen.

Kirby Owen

Director

Tel: [+44 20 7269 0210](tel:+442072690210)

Kirby.Owen@cepa.co.uk

This email is confidential and any unauthorised use or disclosure is prohibited.

From: Mark Cockburn
Sent: 17 November 2016 08:26
To: Kirby Owen

Subject: RE: FW: HPRM: RE: Northern Ireland Assembly Public Accounts Committee Evidence Session 10
November 2016

Kirby

With high demand, degression w tely push the tariff below the marginal cost of heat genera t is surprising is that if it what such an obvious opportunity as you suggest – how come it took about three years for anyone to spot it?

Mark

PS At this point, helpful comments / ideas are what I require, I'm sure I'll hav y to deal with next Wednesday.

From: Kirby Owen

Sent: 16 November 2016 22:03

To: Willy Rickett - External Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry; Mark Cockburn
<mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>

Cc: Paget Fulcher <paget.fulcher@cepa.co.uk>; Paul Grimal <paul.grimal@cepa.co.uk>

Subject: Re: FW: HPRM: RE: Northern Ireland Assembly Public Accounts Committee Evidence Session 10
November 2016

per our long email conversa esterday, t ombined with a single-part (energy only) subsidy which was greater than variable cost was indeed a design flaw that incen viour. See Paul's graph from yesterday. I'm less concerned about lack of degression.

Agree with Willy that it seems unarguable that at least that aspect had bad effect. That doesn't excuse lack of monitoring, but to me it is certain tha variable cost, some of the problems would have never occurred.

Very unfortunate that the explana ted out in the first report (i.e., tha as unnecessary there because at tha -kwh subsidy was less than the variable cost) was apparently ignored in the 2nd.

Ouch.

Kirby Owen

Director

Tel: [+44 20 7269 0210](tel:+442072690210)

Kirby.Owen@cepa.co.uk

This email is confidential. Any unauthorised use or disclosure is prohibited.

From: William Rickett Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

Sent: 16 November 2016 18:59:36

To: Mark Cockburn

Cc: Kirby Owen; Paget Fulcher; Paul Grimal

Subject: Re: FW: HPRM: RE: Northern Ireland Assembly Public Accounts Committee Evidence Session 10
November 2016

This is a rather damning report. Sections 3.19 to 3.32 conclude that the omission of tiering and degression was a fundamental error in the design and that CEPA did not draw sufficient attention, in its second report, either to the fact that the subsidy was being set higher than the fuel cost or to the risks of doing so and the consequent need for tight controls. While the report says

that the controls and monitoring were inadequate, it says that the design flaws made the effective operation of controls much more difficult. It also says that these flaws will have encouraged people to abuse the scheme and the eligibility criteria were too vague to stop this. It describes tiering and degression as important cost control features.

In the light of this, we may have to be slightly less hawkish in claiming that tiering and degression are not primarily cost controls. We should concede that they clearly have some effect but they cannot replace the power to close a cash limited but demand led scheme to applications.

Willy

William Rickett CB | Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry

On Wed, Nov 16, 2016 at 4:14 PM, Mark Cockburn <mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk> wrote:

FYI

From: Coyne, Terence [mailto:Terence.Coyne@economy-ni.gov.uk]
Sent: 16 November 2016 15:25
To: Mark Cockburn <mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>
Subject: FW: HPRM: RE: Northern Ireland Assembly Public Accounts Committee Evidence Session 10 November 2016

Mark

I sent the PwC report to you on 11 November (see e mail below). This is still the latest version. Is this the report to which your e mail sent at twenty past three today refers?

Regards

Terry

Terence Coyne

Governance Accountability and Casework
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP
Tel: 02890529406 (ext: 29406)
Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry
TextRelay: 18001 02890529406
Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk

[<image001.png>](#)

[<image002.gif>](#)

[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: Coyne, Terence
Sent: 11 November 2016 16:55

To: 'Mark Cockburn'
Cc: McCormick, Andrew (DFE); McCann, Brendan; McFarlane, Iain
Subject: HPRM: RE: Northern Ireland Assembly Public Accounts Committee Evidence Session 10 November 2016

Mark

Please find attached the PwC “final” report on the scheme. This isn't the final report as we are expecting an updated report in the near future to reflect the current position relating to the recommendations at Section 4. This will be forwarded following receipt.

Regards

Terry

Terence Coyne

Governance Accountability and Casework
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP
Tel: 02890529406 (ext: 29406)
Mob: Personal information redacted by the RHI Inquiry
TextRelay: 18001 02890529406
Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk

[<image001.png>](#)

[<image002.gif>](#)

[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?

From: Mark Cockburn [<mailto:mark.cockburn@cepa.co.uk>]
Sent: 11 November 2016 08:14
To: Coyne, Terence
Cc: Sewell, Julie; McCormick, Andrew (DFE)
Subject: RE: Northern Ireland Assembly Public Accounts Committee Evidence Session 10 November 2016

Dear Terry

Thanks for sending these through. As I mentioned on the call I would very much like to see the PwC report as it is important in terms of setting out what has happened as a result of the design of the scheme. Is this something that can be arranged?

Kind regards

Mark

Sent from [Mail](#) for Windows 10

From: [Coyne, Terence](#)
Sent: 10 November 2016 15:22
To: [Mark Cockburn](#)
Cc: [Sewell, Julie](#)
Subject: Northern Ireland Assembly Public Accounts Committee Evidence Session 10 November 2016

Mark

Further to our telephone conversation, please see attached a letter and guidance for witnesses at Public Accounts Committee evidence sessions.

Regards

Terry

Terence Coyne

Governance Accountability and Casework
Department for the Economy
Netherleigh
Massey Avenue
Belfast, BT4 2JP

Tel: 02890529406 (ext: 29406)

Mob Personal information redacted by the RHI

Inquiry

TextRelay: 18001 02890529406

Web: www.economy-ni.gov.uk

[<image001.png>](#)

[<image002.gif>](#)

[NI Year of Food & Drink 2016](#)

Please consider the environment - do you really need to print this e-mail?